Society for Educating Women

SEW@AESA: Diversity in Global Contexts for Educating Women

2014 Conference
October 29-November 2, 2014
Toronto, Ontario

http://Educatingwomen.net
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Board of Directors and Organizing Team</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conference Schedule</td>
<td>3-6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014 Conference Proceedings</td>
<td>8-121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conference Participants</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hyatt-Regency-Toronto Floor Plan</td>
<td>123-124</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SEW@AESA: Diversity in Global Contexts for Educating Women
October 29-November 2, 2014
Toronto, Ontario

2014 Officers and Planning Team:

President
Julie Michelle Davis, University of Oklahoma

President Elect and Conference Chair:
Susan Laird, University of Oklahoma

Immediate Past President
Linda Ann Hoeptner Poling, Kent State University

Secretary
Michael Surbaugh, University of Oklahoma

Treasurer
Amy Smith, University of Oklahoma

Graduate Student Liaison
Brandy Close, Oklahoma State University

Registration and Hospitality
Sula You, University of Oklahoma

Artwork for scholarship auction donated
Susan Sherman, IKON journal editor

Educating Women Oral History Project
Amy Smith, Director, University of Oklahoma
Roksana Alavi, Consultant, University of Oklahoma

On-site A/V assistance
Joshua Davis, University of Oklahoma

Conference Image Artist, Proceedings Program, and Proceedings Managing Editor
Catherine Kinyon, Oklahoma City Community College & University of Oklahoma

Special Thanks to the American Educational Studies Association President Elect and Program Chair Jolie Medina and On-Site Coordinator and Treasurer Sandra Spickard Prettyman for their generous support in providing SEW meeting spaces and catering assistance.
SEW@AESA 2014 PROGRAM:

Thursday, 30 October:

10:00-11:45 a.m., Regency B
Mary Jo Hinsdale, Westminster College
AESA/IAIE session presentation, Underrepresented Undergraduate Women in STEM: Taking the Decolonial Turn

12:00-1:30 p.m., Regency A
Shahnaz Khan, Wilfrid Laurier University
AESA/IAIE panel discussion, Contested Imaginaries: Anti-Colonial Pedagogies and the Representation of Muslim Women in Post 9/11 Cultural Practice

12:00-1:30 p.m., Regency C
Kelly McFaden and Sheri Hardee, University of North Georgia
AESA/IAIE session presentation, Developing Gender and Orientation Curricula to Reduce Bullying in K-12 Institutions

1:45-3:15 p.m., Regency E
Claudia Cervantes-Soon, University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill
AESA/IAIE session presentation, A Critical Look at Dual Language Immersion in the New Latino/a Diaspora

5:30-7:00 p.m., King I
AESA George Kneller Lecture
Susan Laird, University of Oklahoma, 2014 SEW Program Chair and President Elect
Under the Gun

Friday, 31 October:

8:30-10:00 a.m., Studio C
Vanina Mozziconacci, Ecole Normale Superieure de Lyon, France
AESA/IAIE session presentation, Authority and Power in Feminist Pedagogies

10:15-11:45 a.m., Studio D
Jan Armstrong and Alicia Gonzales, University of New Mexico
AESA/IAIE session presentation, Images of Women Reading and Doing Science: Resisting Convention, Professional Socialization, and Educating Women in the Postcolonial Thirsdspace

12:00-1:30 p.m., Metro Hall 304
Jeannette Alarcon, University of North Carolina, Greensboro
AESA/IAIE session presentation, Citizenship Education as the Pervasive Hidden Curriculum: The Case of Yearbooks
12:00-1:30 p.m., Regency C
Claudia Cervantes-Soon, University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill
AESA/IAIE session presentation, Muejeras Truchas: Urban Girls Redefining Smartness in a Dystopic Global South

12:00-1:30 p.m., Regency D
Amy Shuffleton, Loyola University, Chicago
AESA/IAIE session presentation given on her behalf, Privatizing Education and Re-Privatizing the Family: Gender and the Neoliberal Narrative of Child-Raising

12:00-1:30 p.m., Metro Hall 308
Kathryn Fishman-Weaver, University of Missouri-Columbia
AESA/IAIE session presentation, Reconceptualizing Motherhood, Poetry, and Praxis Within a Feminist Framework

1:45-3:15 p.m., Studio B
Susan Franzosa, Fairfield University, SEW Founder and Past President
panel presenter for AESA session, “AESA Past Presidents Engaging with the Past, Present, and the Future of the Organization”

1:45-3:15 p.m. Regency D
Julie Davis, University of Oklahoma
AESA/IAIE session presentation, Breast Cancer in Global Contexts: Autobiographies and Educating Women

5:30-7:00 p.m.
AESA R. Freeman Butts Lecture
Pedro Noguera, New York University
The Limits and Possibilities of Schooling in an Unequal Society

**Saturday, 1 November:**

9:30-11:00 a.m., Hyatt Regency Board Room
SEW Seminar A: Women in STEAM

Chair: Susan Douglas Franzosa, Fairfield University

Catherine Kinyon, University of Oklahoma
Meaningful Looking: The Power of Provocative Images as Language, Curriculum, and Engagement

Jan Armstrong and Alicia Gonzales, University of New Mexico
Images of Women Reading and Doing Science: Resisting Convention, Professional Socialization and Educating Women in the Postcolonial Thirdspace
Maike Philipsen, Virginia Commonwealth University
*Educating Women: Overcoming Immunity to Change on the Road to Diversity in STEM Fields*

11:30-1:20 p.m., King Street Social Balcony
**Presidential Address and Business Meeting**

11:30 a.m.-12:15 p.m. Julie Davis, University of Oklahoma, SEW presidential address, Educating Women for Gender Insubordination in the Breast Cancer Industrial Complex

12:30-1:20 p.m. SEW Business Meeting and Luncheon (draft program):
I. Adoption of 2013 Business Meeting Minutes
II. Treasurer Report
III. 2014 Founder’s Awards Presentation
IV. Vote for 2015 Slate of Officers:
   President: Susan Laird
   Program chair and 2016 President-Elect: Paula Salvio, NOMINATED
   Treasurer: Amy Smith
   Secretary: Diane Zachary Karns, NOMINATED
   Member at Large:
   Immediate Past President: Julie Davis
   I/T and Website Director: Catherine Kinyon

1:30-3:00 p.m., Hyatt Regency Board Room
**SEW Seminar B: Educating Incarcerated, Shamed, Vulnerable Women**

Chair: Paula Salvio, University of New Hampshire

Kayley Mary Gillespie, University of Oklahoma
*Contraception Among Incarcerated Women: Educating Women on the Importance of Preventative and Rehabilitative Measures Respective of One’s Cultural, Gender, and Sexual Identity*

Sula You, University of Oklahoma
*Educating Women: A Conversation About Shame for Gender-Sensitive Education*

Julie Marie Frye, Indiana University, Bloomington
*Educating Vulnerable Women: (Re)conceptualizing Occupational Socialization by Engaging with Emancipatory Practices*
3:30-5:00 p.m., King I
AESA Presidential address, Cris Mayo, University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign
“Unexpected Generosity and Inevitable Trespass: Rethinking Intersectionality”

5:00-6:00 p.m., King I
AESA business meeting

6:30-8:30 p.m. SEW Community Dinner, Location TBD

Sunday, 2 November

8:30-10:00 a.m., Regency C
Stacia Ann Cedillo, The University of Texas, Austin
AESA/IAIE session presentation, “Gender and Education in the U.S. Military: Narrative of Agency Among Female Soldiers”
2014 Conference Proceedings of the Society for Educating Women
BREAKING ASSIMILATIONIST Binds: Peer-to-Peer Latina Mentoring
Jeannette Alarcón, The University of North Carolina, Greensboro
Silvia C. Bettez, The University of North Carolina, Greensboro

Purpose

According to the Chronicle of Higher Education, “Hispanics” comprise only 4% of the full-time faculty in U.S. universities (all ranks included), while the Latino/as comprise 16.4% of the U.S. population.1 Given the national and local underrepresentation of scholars of color, efforts to support and retain current Latina faculty are paramount. Collaborative autoethnography serves as a vehicle for us, two Latina scholars, to unpack the dimensions, complexities, and possibilities of creating support through Latina-to-Latina peer mentoring. We situate our experiences within and in contrast to traditional faculty mentoring structures.

Context

Mentoring as a practice for development spans a variety of fields including the academic setting though much of the work detailing university mentoring is focused on faculty/student relationships.2 Literature addressing professional development components of perceived supports for women and other minorities -- including building knowledge about institutional norms, professional advancement, and managing work/personal life balance -- is well documented in the corporate world.3 Additionally, mentoring literature describes the advantages accrued by those who are mentored as compared to those who are not.4 This body of research has historically focused on the ways in which formalized mentoring relationships are designed to acclimate new employees to the work place with little consideration of the pair’s compatibility.5

More recent literature extends to include the importance of “matching” the participants with the hope of fostering a more meaningful relationship.6 Amid a growing call for consideration of making appropriate and productive matches between mentor and mentee, there is little evidence
that deep consideration is given to allowing, identifying and/or fostering mentoring relationships that attend to the unique experiences of groups historically and continually marginalized within the university setting. Additionally, the literature reveals a lack of complex understandings of the relationships forged between the mentor and mentee. Zellers et al. point out that while much “how to” literature exists in both business and academe there is a significant lack in the “richer data [that] could be obtained by qualitatively examining the actual experience of mentoring from both mentors’ and mentees’ perspectives.”

Although research exists about mentoring and Latina faculty experiences generally, we could find no specific literature regarding mentoring between Latina faculty of different ranks and we located only one article about peer mentoring between Latina faculty.

**Positionality**

We work together at the same public predominantly White university (PWI). Jeannette began working at The University in August 2013, while Silvia began in 2007 and obtained tenure just before Jeannette arrived. We are both Latinas of approximately the same age. We work in distinct departments in the School of Education.

**Methods**

We engaged in collaborative autoethnography to explore aspects of our relationship related to mentoring between Latinas. “Autoethnography is an approach to research and writing that seeks to describe and systematically analyze (graphy) personal experience (auto) in order to understand cultural experience (ethno).” We systematically analyzed the cultural and gendered experience of our developing mentoring experience. We have been meeting together biweekly for “writing group time” since Jeannette arrived. Although the formal reason for meeting is writing group, our time together has evolved into check-ins, advice and story-sharing and collaborative projects.
Our conversations led us to realize, reflect and acknowledge this activity as mentoring. For many reasons, our mentoring relationship stands in contrast to traditional formal mentoring. DeLeon in his article on autoethnography argues, “testimony opens new ways of looking at the world by participating in a subversive form of scholarship.”

Once we began to understand our relationship this way, we decided to examine its ongoing development using autoethography.

Ellis, Adams and Bochner explain that autoethnographers write selectively about past experiences often with a focus on “epiphanies that stem from, or are made possible by, being part of a culture and/or possessing a particular cultural identity.” Reflxeive writings gathered through keeping personal ongoing journals serve as our primary data source. Calendars, notes from meetings, and work from collective projects served as secondary data sources. Data analysis included initial coding and then moving from codes, to categories, to themes comparing and contrasting existing mentoring research with our personal experiences. We discerned “patterns of cultural experience” through collective storytelling “to produce an aesthetic and evocative thick description of personal and interpersonal experiences.”

Findings

We share, in first person, reflexive vignettes illustrating milestone moments that informed and created our non-traditional mentoring relationship over the course of one academic year. The moments we chose, resulting from our data analysis, include our first meeting, forming a writing group and working collaboratively on two projects. Each set of vignettes is followed by an analytical reflection.
Meeting for the First Time

Silvia. Before Jeannette came to The University I was approached by two White faculty members in her department who informed me that they had “just hired a new Latina faculty member” I had to meet. Additionally, at an Educational Studies conference, my friend Luis, a Latino faculty member who served on Jeannette’s committee told me that I needed to connect with her and support her in her transition. When I interviewed for my position, the head of the search committee was a Latina faculty member in my department, who I ultimately asked to be my mentor. I knew how important it was for me to have Leila as a source of support and wanted to be sure that I could extend that same kind of presence to Jeannette.

Jeannette. When I shared with my committee that I had received and accepted a job offer, Luis, one of my committee members urged me to contact Silvia as soon as possible. Once I arrived in North Carolina, I emailed to ask if we could meet; she agreed and offered to meet me for either wine or coffee. Because I anticipated this as a formal meeting, I thought it wise to research her work and be prepared to answer questions. However during our first meeting, I quickly realized that she was not aiming to judge my knowledge and would be a good ally to have in my new place. She readily acknowledged that she would be willing to help me as much as possible. From the beginning, it seemed that she knew I would need a unique type of support as the only Latina in my department.

Analytical reflection

We wish to highlight here the informal network that led to our meeting, and the importance of extending oneself to be available for support (as the “mentor”). Tara Yosso, critiquing Bourdieu’s work on cultural capital as privileging White, middle class culture, proposed the
notion of community cultural wealth as “an array of knowledge, skills, abilities and contacts possessed and utilized by Communities of Color to survive and resist macro and micro-forms of oppression.”15 These forms of wealth, according to Yosso, are “meant to be shared.”16 Yosso’s articulated framework of community cultural wealth depicts the interconnected forms of several types of capital including aspirational, linguistic, familial, social, navigational, and resistant capitals.17 Our stories above point to the use of social and navigational capitals. Social capital “can be understood as networks of people and community resources.”18 Although Yosso articulates her work in the context of K-12 education, her framework can be useful in understanding the importance of social capital among faculty of color. Yosso explains, “Scholars note that historically, People of Color have utilized their social capital to attain education, legal justice, employment and health care. In turn, these Communities of Color gave the information and resources they gained through these institutions back to their social networks.”19 We see our networking, initiated by Luis, as a form of giving information and resources gained, in this case, to support Jeannette’s entry into new work and geographic environments. Navigational capital, “refers to skills of maneuvering through social institutions. Historically, this infers the ability to maneuver through institutions not created with Communities of Color in mind [such as a PWI].”20 Our meeting story alludes to navigational capital as Jeannette reached out to Silvia and Silvia returned with an invitation to provide support.

Writing Group

Silvia. Excited to have another Latina faculty member in the School of Education (this would make a total of three) and wanting to create a structure for connection, I decided to ask Jeannette if she would be interested in meeting regularly to write together. I figured this could be beneficial for both of us; it would allow her the space to ask me mentoring types of questions and
me the chance to get to know her better. We decided to meet biweekly at a coffee shop. From our first meeting, it was clear that we had several overlapping interests. For the writing group, we collectively decided to structure our meetings in four parts: (a) a check in about work done over the past two weeks, (b) sharing what we planned to do for the afternoon and the next two weeks, (c) writing time, and (d) time to ask each other questions about any sticking points in our writing. Thus, the structure itself was designed for us to support each other in mutually beneficial ways. At our first meeting, Jeannette asked questions related to navigating her work as a new faculty member. However, she also helped me think through a challenging issue I was working through with a senior faculty member. As we continued to meet, our time together shifted from more formal check-ins to story sharing about both work and life outside of work. We talked with each other about how to deal with challenges in our departments, teaching, research, and writing. We eventually had to lengthen our meetings to include what I think of as “connection time” (lasting between 30 and 60 minutes) before delving into our original four-part structure. During this connection time we grew as colleagues and developed a friendship.

Jeannette. I remember being disappointed to learn that mentoring assignments were made via departmental appointment within the School of Education as opposed to allowing space for cross-departmental mentoring relationships. Instead of being “allowed” to choose a mentor who I felt could help foster my professional identity development, I was assigned a white, male mentor who exhibited accepted versions of success within the academy. Without regard for this policy, during a lunch meeting, Silvia suggested that we form a bi-weekly writing group. This became much more than a space for writing. During one particular meeting she was struggling with an encounter she had had with a well-respected full professor. I was a bit surprised when she asked my advice and even more surprised when she complimented my suggestions. That moment
provided the realization that she was willing to engage in a partnership where I felt valued as opposed to a traditional hierarchical mentoring structure. The writing group was becoming a space for articulating perspectives and working together to achieve our goals.

**Analytical reflection**

The above vignettes illustrate one of the ways in which we circumvented the School of Education’s mentoring structure, which focuses heavily on a traditional view of mentoring. The established practice in our School focused mainly on academic socialization\(^\text{21}\) in the form of pairing Jeannette with a mentor who had a strong publication record, a focused yet narrow service record and stellar teaching evaluations. It appeared that the assignment was based upon the assumption that somehow he would be able to transfer this version of success without consideration for the nuances of Jeannette’s cultural-historical experience. While Silvia consistently communicated the importance of achieving the type of success necessary for earning promotion and tenure, she also promoted and supported Jeannette’s own ways of knowing as opposed to working toward making Jeannette into a version of herself. We formed what Cowin, Cohen, Ciechanowski, and Orozco call a “learning partnership.”\(^\text{22}\) Such partnerships create a space for negotiating past power issues and developing a relationship that is both “mutual and synergetic.”\(^\text{23}\) Our “connection time” coincides with research about Latina faculty that dissolves the artificial work/life separation.\(^\text{24}\) Perhaps more importantly, because Silvia facilitated forging a mutually beneficial relationship, she has been able to help navigate what Mullen & Forbes term “a crisis of professional identity”\(^\text{25}\) wherein Jeannette could have experienced lack of support and understanding within her department.
Forging Academic Partnerships

Silvia. Jeannette and I became members of a budding Latino/a faculty, staff, and student group on campus, Alianza. One of the leaders felt it would be helpful to create a series of dialogues on the broad topic of “Borderlands.” Having mentioned that any discussion of borderlands necessitated a foundational discussion of Gloria Anzaldúa’s work, I was asked to create and facilitate the first dialogue. During our connection time Jeannette and I discovered that Anzaldúa was a primary influence in our thinking and ways of being as scholars. Furthermore, Jeannette was present when I emphasized the need to start the “Borderlands” dialogues with Anzaldúa’s work, and she chimed in with a rationale for using this work as a starting point. Thus, when I was asked to do this talk, I invited Jeannette to co-create and co-facilitate the first Borderlands dialogue with me. Although I was excited about the possibility of the collaborative project, I also knew that this kind of presentation would create an opportunity for her to establish a leadership presence early in her career, help her to make connections with people across campus, and could be listed on her vita, assisting her in her journey towards promotion and tenure. Jeannette accepted the invitation, and we developed a plan to engage people in dialogue around main concepts from Borderlands/La Frontera using work I had previously developed on “critical community building” as a foundation for the discussion. We worked collaboratively from start to finish bringing our individual strengths to the collective process. The event was well-attended by faculty and students (several faculty from both our departments attended in support), participants were engaged, and the feedback was positive.

Shortly after the presentation, Jeannette informed me that she wanted to take my concept of critical community building, purposefully enact it in her summer course with master’s students, and conduct a research project about the experience and impact. I was thrilled that she wanted to
implement this concept and grateful that she invited me to be a part of the research project. She took the lead on this project, which is still in process, and our learning partnership continued to grow in both academically concrete and relationship-enhancing ways.

**Jeannette.** Early in the fall semester of 2013, Silvia invited me to a lunch meeting with a newly formed Latina/o networking group on campus. She consistently found ways to connect me with helpful networks across campus. One of the group’s leaders invited her to give a talk during the Office of Multicultural Affairs speaker series entitled Borderlands. Gloria Anzaldúa’s work plays a significant role in my development as a critical Chicana scholar. I could hardly believe it when Silvia asked me to co-present with her. The invitation not only provided an additional opportunity to extend professional networks, it also positioned me as a relevant contributor to a project that I felt invested in. As we worked together to create the presentation, again I felt that my ideas and contributions were taken seriously and valued. While creating this presentation, I was able to learn more about her scholarship. I became intrigued with the concept of critical community building and possibilities for its usefulness in the teacher education classroom.

During the spring 2014 semester, I was asked to co-teach a summer course entitled “Intersections of Classroom Management and Instruction.” As I began to plan for the course and conceptualize the procedures and norms we would be practicing, it occurred to me that the critical community building concept could be a valuable resource in helping establish our norms for engaging in dialogue together. I approached Silvia to ask her if she would be willing to work with me to apply this concept within the class and also formulate a small study to understand the students’ experiences while engaging in this type of community. She offered her support of my ideas. We talked through some of the strategies I could use for implementing this practice, but ultimately she encouraged me to design the project within the construct of teacher education. Once again,
Silvia supported my professional growth via a learning partnership. In this instance, we took turns in the “expert” role – she as the author of the concept and my knowledge of pre-service teachers.

Analytic reflection

As critical scholars we both understand the importance of being aware of power differentials and working towards diffusing hierarchies. Silvia realized that she could/should play a mentoring role. As a social justice oriented educator, she is invested in critical community building and thinking through ways we can foster collaboration and minimize competition. This is especially important for minoritized people, who are all ultimately harmed when competing against each other in a White-stream system.28 Similarly, Jeannette’s own critical understanding of the hierarchy present in traditional mentoring relationships informed her choice to actively forge a learning partnership with Silvia. She simultaneously drew upon Silvia’s social and navigational capitals as a tenured faculty member to help navigate official university spaces while expressing her aspirational capital in forging her own pathway toward professional identity development. They both drew upon cultural capital in their collaborative academic work. While the nature of the work in these vignettes was professional, the activity was personal. This coincides with the findings from Ek, et al. regarding the specifics of what they term muxerista mentoring, which “includes not only direct support with academic activities like teaching and research but also emotional support.”29 It also aligns with Urrieta and Méndez-Benavidez’s work on the role of Chicana/o professors in the academy. They found that Chicana/o professors held community commitments that “involved the creation of trans/formative spaces for Chicana/o, Latina/o”30 people, and recognized the centrality of a social justice orientation and commitment to activist
scholarship “that validates the epistemologies of those outside the White-stream in U.S. society.”

Conclusion

Our results suggest a disconnect between official mentoring practices and organic mentoring spaces among Latina faculty. As mentioned previously, when Jeannette began her job she was assigned to a faculty mentor in her department who, by all accounts, represented a success story with the underlying assumption that his knowledge and expertise would be transferred to Jeannette. In reality, the relationship proved to be problematic; a cultural divide became apparent as Jeannette attempted to engage in meaningful dialogue with him. In contrast, our learning partnership, while not endorsed or facilitated in any official capacity by the university, has resulted in professional opportunities that may assist Jeannette on her tenure path. This learning partnership is grounded in acknowledging and sharing various forms of community cultural wealth including social, navigational, cultural, and aspirational capitals. It entails consciously working to mitigate power differences through forging mutually beneficial relationships that validate each person’s funds of knowledge and honoring the importance of the imbrication of emotional and academic support.

This work contributes to the dearth of literature regarding mentoring of/between Latina faculty. Given that Latinas comprise only 1.6% of U.S. faculty, it is incumbent upon university administration to reconceptualize practices regarding “inclusion” and faculty diversity. We advocate for the practice of Latina peer mentoring. Our collaborative autoethnographic testimonies elucidate new possibilities for supporting and retaining Latina faculty, particularly those who strive to navigate the complex sociopolitical dynamics of predominantly White universities.


8 Ibid. 582.


11 Ibid. 398.

12 Ibid. 276.


16 Yosso, 70


18 Ibid. p. 79.

19 Ibid. 80.


29 Ibid. 545.

30 Ibid. 227.

31 Ibid. 230.

IMAGES OF WOMEN READING AND DOING SCIENCE: RESISTING CONVENTION, PROFESSIONAL SOCIALIZATION AND EDUCATING WOMEN IN THE POSTCOLONIAL THIRDSPACE

Jan Armstrong, Associate Professor
Department of Individual, Family and Community Education (IFCE)
University of New Mexico

...And by exploring this Third Space, we may elude the politics of polarity and emerge as the others of ourselves (Bhabha, 1994, 33-39)

Contexts

For as long as there have been women readers, authors have offered advice and encouragement in the spirit of “self improvement” through conformity to social conventions (Blair 2012; Jack 2012). This project grew out of earlier work on youth magazines marketed to preadolescent girls. Magazines serve complex cultural ends and multiple constituencies. They promote products, lifestyles and ways of thinking, while also providing a venue for readers to participate in “democratic” and sometimes “empowering” forms of self-expression. Our findings suggested that pre-adolescent girls’ magazines emphasized self-appraisal, social comparison, and strategies for self-improvement. In this respect, they mirrored general interest magazines read by women. In contrast, adolescent boys read the same special interest magazines (focusing on sports and hobbies) that men read. We identified a number of “general interest” magazines intended for preteen girls, but only 1 or 2 such magazines for boys. The content of boys’ magazines showed marked differences from our sample of girls’ magazines. Boys’ magazines included what struck us as “take it or leave it” advice for improving athletic skills or building things, but they did not invite self-focus, social comparison or self-appraisal. Youth magazines provided rich insights into the complex interrelationships between gender, media and
psychological development. This led to our interest in women’s learning and its representation, particularly in the visual arts and in photographic archives.

Social foundations scholars help to preserve spaces for the liberal arts in schools and departments of education (King et al 2007; Mackler 2014). With respect to teacher education, a key challenge for scholars in the humanities and social foundations concerns how to demonstrate the value of non-instrumental, non-technocratic learning for personal and professional growth. How can we create opportunities for our students to explore new ways of thinking about the social world, about their own positions within complex historical movements? We also wanted to explore alternative standpoints from which to consider gender-linked differences in academic achievement (e.g., the indifference that some boys and men show toward reading, and girls’ reported lack of interest in technical careers). Our geographic location in the American Southwest necessitated that we search for local images and employ decolonizing methodologies and frameworks (Smith 1999) in our work. Although neither of us are historians, we were eager to learn about the history of local schools and to learn more about women’s quest for the freedom to read. One of the co-authors, a secondary mathematics teacher and graduate student, searched for images of girls or women “doing math and/or science” in the American Southwest. The other co-author, an anthropologist, explored the history of women’s reading and its representation in the visual arts.

Feminist and postcolonial theoretical perspectives, as well as colleagues and students, have guided our interpretations and generated new questions and concerns about the moral hazards associated with this work (Bhabha 2004; Butler 1989; Caruthers and Friend 2014; Davis 2013; Gilligan 2011; Soja 1996).
The complex milieu of the American Southwest lends itself to postmodern experimentation and post-colonial critique. The population of our state includes multiple distinct indigenous groups (Pueblo Indians) whose direct ancestors arrived in the 1300’s; the descendents of early Spanish colonists who arrived about two hundred years later; the descendents of early Anglo-European settlers; English speaking (white, Anglo) U.S. residents from other states; authorized and unauthorized immigrants and their children, and “New Americans” – foreign born immigrants primarily from Latin America and Asia, and their children. A state website reports that seventy-one percent of the people in the state speak English as their primary language; 24% speak Spanish, just under 3% speak Navajo and 3.4% speak other languages (state historical society website). The indigenous and colonial heritage of the state is evident throughout – in language, music, architecture, art, law, religion, and cultural traditions. Yet each of the subgroups above is comprised of men and women of varying levels of economic and social status, who belong to different occupational, religious, political and recreational groups, have different sexual preferences, and so on. Postcolonial and postcolonial feminist theories examine the implications of such demographic and social complexity in local and global contexts.

Postcolonial theory arose within the postmodern tradition of writing against conventional, modernist assumptions and practices in the fields of art, architecture, literary studies, social sciences and education. Colonialism is a process in which resources are extracted from occupied sites by a colonial power whose members gain wealth at the expense of the people colonized (the subaltern). It involves social domination and control exerted through language, knowledge and representation (Kohn 2014). The economic exploitation associated with former colonial powers from the 16th to the early 20th century has been replaced by neo-colonialistic, multinational enterprises (e.g., tourism, media, sports, corporate outsourcing). Yet domination persists and is
symbolically and linguistically enacted in cultural and educational settings. Postcolonial frameworks assert that each person is a composite of identities – a \textit{hybrid} – and that defining people by their membership in particular subgroups (gender, race, ethnicity, language, or sexual preference) is a form of domination. Postcolonial theorists share a commitment to moving beyond present circumstances while acknowledging the cultural legacies of colonization (e.g., Said, Spivak, and Bhabha). They study the persistence of colonialistic practices and mindsets in contemporary life. One goal of postcolonial theorizing is to promote more equitable social arrangements through analysis, critique and giving voice to subaltern groups.

Third space theory is associated with the work of Soja (1996) in the social sciences and Bhabha (2004) in literary studies. A number of scholars have drawn on third space theory to inform their work in educational settings (Carruthers and Friend 2014; Guttierez 2008; Moje et al 2004; Skerrett 2010). The idea of the third space is that there are some conditions that provide opportunities for individuals who belong to subaltern and dominant groups to interact in ways that can produce new understandings and insights. Third spaces grow out of the interaction of unequal entities that establish a mutually intelligible, hybrid language with which to challenge the logic of colonial domination. For Licona (2005), feminist third space entails “both-and” consciousness.

Third space can be understood as a location and/or practice. As a practice it reveals a differential consciousness capable of engaging creative and coalitional forms of opposition to the limits of dichotomous (mis)representations. As a location, third space has the potential to be a space of shared understanding and meaning-making. (105)
In the sense many authors use the term, third space experiences can be transformational. In writing about the transformative potential of feminist thirldspace scholarship and activist self-published magazines, Licona noted that

In third-space contexts, traditional reading, writing and representational structures and practices are ruptured. (B)orderlands rhetorics are subversive, third-space tactics that can prove discursively disobedient to the confines of phallogocentrism and its colonizing effects over time and place. Third-space subjects put language into play by using disruptive discursive strategies that reflect our lived experiences as fragmented, partial, real, and imagined, and always in the process of becoming. (Licona, 2005, 106)

Moje et al (2004) think of third spaces as sites in which discourse and knowledge from home, peer groups and communities are merged with more formal academic discourse (41). Based on review of geographic, literary and educational literature, Moje et al (2004) identified three ways of conceptualizing third spaces. First, third spaces can provide “a way to build bridges from knowledges and Discourses often marginalized in school settings to the learning of conventional academic knowledges and Discourse…” (43-44). Second, third spaces may afford “a navigational space, a way of crossing and succeeding in different discourse communities” (44). And finally, third spaces may involve “cultural, social, and epistemological change[s] in which the competing knowledges and Discourses of different spaces are brought into “conversation” to challenge and reshape both academic content literacy practices and the knowledges and Discourses of youths’ everyday lives” (44). Moje et al incorporate all three views into their study of funds of knowledge and middle school science content literacy learning.
Methods

We worked inductively – gathering artifacts, staying open to various interpretations, and drawing on the literature. Our initial sample of images was drawn from books, national archives, the Virtual Museum of Education Iconics, and the UNM Center for Southwest Research (CSWR). The high school photographs were first located at CSWR. Through additional archival research, we found information about the photographer and the settings where the photographs were taken. Paintings of women reading were located in texts and online using keyword searches for “women reading” “girls reading” and “men reading”. Each image was assigned an ID number and a log was created to record basic information associated with each item. We did not carry out a formal content analytic study. Rather, we gathered and reviewed a large set of images and identified patterns based on critical review and comparison of the images.

We developed two slide-shows for display on an e-poster (large monitor) at our department research showcase. [These have been included in the supplementary materials.] This was, at least in part, necessary to effectively convey our findings. However, using e-posters was also an act of resistance, as the normative way to present findings at the conference has always involved the display of scientific posters (displaying “scientific” work). Our more humanistic approach challenged convention and we hoped that this, in turn, could create new spaces for scholarly conversation and ways of thinking about the nature of “research” within the department and the College of Education (Gilligan 2011). A colleague who viewed the electronic poster (e-poster) presentations that grew out of this project thought our strategy for inviting audiences to view, interpret and discuss our data might constitute a third space learning environment. He felt that his students (who were enrolled in a seminar focusing on third space theory in education) might find it useful to view our e-posters. We describe this performance (sharing our presentation with
Findings and Observations

The images with which we worked seemed to require different presentation strategies. Our first presentation displayed local images of science classes without a lot of elaboration, encouraging audience observations and commentary. Some of our work with these images involved investigating their origin and the contexts that produced them. The images depict students in the three high schools: Valley High School, [City] High School and Highland High School. Dr. E.R. Harrington took the photographs. Harrington was a science teacher at [City] High School who was named first director of secondary instruction for the school district. The images are from an article Harrington published in the “School Journal” in 1955, in response to claims that schools were not producing enough highly trained technical experts. He argued that local schools were “measuring up” in math and science courses, supplementing his argument with photographs. As a practitioner, he tried to change the narrative about the quality of education offered in local classrooms and schools.

We noted that there were fewer girls than boys depicted in the set of photographs. Girls were dressed in what would be considered more formal attire (dresses) than would be typical in public schools today. It seemed to us that the girls were as engaged with the materials as the boys. When we shared the presentation with seminar students, after a brief introduction, we invited comments and observations: “What do you see?” A lively conversation ensued in which students, many of whom were teachers, commented on the photographs. One noted that all of the students were “white.” Another recognized one of the classrooms because she worked at that school. She was surprised that it looked “almost exactly the same” today. This generated critical commentaries on the lack of public commitment to providing resources needed to remodel and
update aging school buildings. [We learned later that this school was on the historic register, its architectural features intentionally preserved.] Group members speculated on the purposes for which the photographs were taken, and one noted that the nature of photography in 1955 made it likely that the photographer would have selected his subjects with care. He observed that it cost more money and time to develop photographs then and is the case today.

A number of patterns can be seen in the images of women reading we have analyzed to date. These were presented to the seminar students in an abbreviated version of the original slide presentation. (The original, full-length presentation file has been included in Supplementary Materials.) The presentation on women and men reading was more scripted. Carruthers and Friend (2014) noted that first and second space pedagogies are inevitably oriented around text, over which the teacher exerts considerable control. We discovered that this may well be the case even when images are given precedence over text. On the other hand, the images of men and women reading seemed to provide a narrative of potential interest to educators. Our hope was that each viewer might develop their own theories about the exceptionally large number of paintings of women reading (and comparatively small number of men doing so). From a liberal arts perspective, we wanted to offer audience members an innovative, engaging glimpse into the history of education and the cultural legacy of patriarchy. With limited time left in the session, we displayed the images, sharing some of our observations. For example, we have found that

1. Artists have often chosen to depict people reading in paintings, frescos, tapestries, and architecture. These artifacts contain valuable information about the social contexts in which they were created.
2. For women, reading has long been associated with virtue, self-critique, self-regulation and self-improvement.

3. Women are often depicted alone or with a female companion reading books in tranquil settings. Until the 20th century, women’s reading was associated with the private sphere.

4. Women and girls are shown teaching young children to read in family settings.

5. Women are portrayed reading books for pleasure and piety. Visual representations capture public anxieties over the moral hazards of reading for girls and women.

6. Artists have depicted men (alone) reading books as an act of piety.

7. Portraits of men highlight the instrumental uses of reading for work. Men are shown in proximity to reading materials (rather than engaged in reading), with artifacts associated with their profession or avocation nearby.

8. When artists portray men reading, their depictions are located within the public sphere (work, politics, public affairs, colonial taverns).

9. Men are often shown reading newspapers and pamphlets, blueprints, musical scores, and scientific notes, which connote reading for information.

One of the concerns that emerged from our work on artistic representations of men and women reading was that the very large set of paintings we analyzed was culturally monolithic. Almost all of the images of readers in our sample showed relatively affluent people of European or American descent. Our analysis has afforded us with insights into the history of educating women in a patriarchal world system. Yet the presentation itself might appear to be a celebration of White femininity. Third space theory has us thinking about indigenous counter-narratives. We wonder what students might have had to say about this had there been more time for discussion.
Conclusions

One of the assumptions underlying this work is that visual analysis of images can deepen self-understanding and nurture professional growth. Through visual analysis of historical paintings and photographs, we have gained fresh insights into the complex legacies of power and subordination that continue to influence the lives of contemporary educators. The study of education iconics provides a tangible way for students to engage in critical, collective cultural analysis at a time of profound cultural transformation. Although not discussed in this paper, we believe that education iconics projects can benefit professionals in training by fostering critical awareness of the educative power of visual environments. Visual analysis may help create a third space for collectively investigating how historical forces reach forward and find expression within hybrid communities of practice and being. Although empirical evidence is needed, we speculate that the processes involved in this engagement might be as important as the “disinterested” (liberal arts) knowledge acquired. Critical inspection of visual images – learning to look and to listen – is a collective activity that invites conversations across differences.
References:


Skerrett, Allison 2010. “Lolita, Facebook and the Thirdspace of Literacy Teacher Education.”
   *Educational Studies, 46*: 67-84


http://arts.gov/publications/highlights-from-2012-sppa
Appendix A

For more information about the original e-poster presentation, contact Jan Armstrong (jka@unm.edu) or Alicia Gonzales (Acgonzales@umass.edu) or visit “http://edprof.net” and search for “Women Reading and Doing Science”

All photographs used in our analysis are part of the E. R. Harrington Pictorial Collection Pict 000-299 (Box 1, Folders 3-9; Box 2, Folders 10 & 11). Center for Southwest Research, University Libraries, University of New Mexico.
http://elibrary.unm.edu/cswr/index.php
http://rmoa.unm.edu/docviewer.php?docId=nmu1pict000-299.xml
Appendix B

For more information about the original e-poster presentation, contact Jan Armstrong (jka@unm.edu) or Alicia Gonzales (Acsgonzales@umass.edu) or visit “http://edprof.net” and search for “Women Reading and Doing Science.” Some of the images used in our e-poster are part of Ayers Bagley’s photographic collection – visit The Virtual Museum of Education Iconics – http://iconics.cehd.umn.edu/ (e.g., “In Search of the Liberal Arts” gallery http://iconics.cehd.umn.edu/SevenLiberalArts/Gallery/default.html). Visit Art Resource (http://artres.com) to view representative fine arts images. Use the Browse function to search for “women reading” and “men reading” or enter image reference numbers.

Images of Women Reading

Images of Men Reading

RECONCEPTUALIZING MOTHERHOOD, POETRY AND PRAXIS WITHIN A FEMINIST FRAMEWORK
Kathryn Fishman-Weaver, University of Missouri

Tikkun Olam, To heal, repair and transform the world

To understand who I am as a mother and a teacher is to understand my mother and her mother before her. The way I mother (a verb) and am a mother (a noun) is inexorably linked to my mother and grandmothers. This is not to say we are all the same. Instead, I am a unique product of their histories, ideologies, and experiences. The following autoethnography attempts to tease out the complex constructs of my identity as understood through the stories of my mother and grandmothers. Autoethnography is a distinct qualitative research practice that uses data about self, including personal histories, in order to explore connections between self and practice or self and others. (Ngunjiri, Hernandez, and Chang, 2010) As a writer I use writing and the writing process as an inquiry tool. (Ellis, 2013) The use of life history, poetics, and the privileging of positionality is a distinctly feminist framework. (Belenky, 1997; Hooks, 200; Middleton, 1993) As a feminist writer, I am interested in the ways the traits and experiences of my grandmothers continue to impact the ways I interact and teach in our globalized world. As a teacher and educational scholar, I am interested in the ways this identity work informs practice. (Belenky, 1997) I conclude with a discussion of how these personal histories impact my current classroom pedagogy.

Grandma Sophie, an unacknowledged critical theorist

I begin with a poem about my grandmother:

My Grandmother, A Ghost Story

There was no moon that night, the first time the ghost of my grandmother visited me. We were driving home,
about to turn back into town, when she ran her wrinkled fingers through my hair and drew a long slow circle on my back.

I tensed in shock, then relaxed under her familiar touch.

I turned to you, opened my mouth, but didn’t know what to say.

We drove home, climbed into bed and I drew the same long slow circle on your back. You fell asleep under my touch.

Last summer my grandmother was a frequent visitor, always at night, always when I couldn’t sleep. Sometimes I found her in the nursery, rocking back and forth in the rocking chair, singing Italian opera to my sleeping daughter. Other times I found her at the dining room table playing cards. I wanted to run into my son’s room, shake him awake and have him come play with her. But I didn’t. I know enough about ghosts to know he’d think it was a dream. Oftentimes, she was in the kitchen cutting fruit and muttering in Yiddish. And like a dream, on those strange nights, I understood every word.

The last time I saw her, she was walking in my vegetable garden reciting her favorites: Whitman, Dreiser, Shakespeare enlightening my zucchinis and cucumbers. I caught up with her in the tomatoes.

“Parting is such sweet sorrow.” she sang like a lullaby.

“Yes”, I sighed, “it is”.
My paternal grandmother, Sophie Fishman-Frager, was a first generation Russian immigrant. Growing up, my grandmother told me their drafty apartment in Brooklyn was always filled with cousins.

“If you had two arms, two legs, and spoke Yiddish, you were a cousin.”

My grandma Sophie was an ideological product of the Holocaust. In Hebrew, tikkun olam refers to the work of healing, repairing, and transforming the world. My grandmother spoke of this same practice which she colloquially called, “making life livable for all.”

Grandma Sophie was passionate about justice, equality, and freedom. My grandmother, a poor girl from an immigrant family had limited access to formal higher education. For her learning happened outside of the ivory tower in the diverse community of the lower east side of New York City and in thick volumes of literature and theory. When she was a young woman Grandma Sophie loved dancing in Harlem. One of her favorite stories was of a night she and her husband won a bottle of champagne as the best couples dancers at a jazz club. She wrote articles in Yiddish for an underground social justice newspaper. When she was older my grandmother took a bus from New York to D.C. to see Dr. King and participate in the March on Washington. In her retirement my grandmother volunteered as a social studies teacher in the Miami Public Schools. The students in her classes called her Abuela. She learned Spanish so that she could have more meaningful conversations with her students in their home language. On my birthday she would call and sing me, “Feliz Cumpleanos a ti”.

When I was in high school my grandma Sophie moved in with us. I remember my mother and I trying to make Jewish foods. The first time we made matzo balls they sunk like stones in our soup.

Grandma Sophie would tell me jokes in Yiddish.
“Grandma I don’t speak Yiddish”.

“I know, but the jokes are only funny in Yiddish. English isn’t a funny language.”

She’d proceed to tell me a joke, always in Yiddish. She could never get all the way through the joke without laughing. Her face would turn red and shake as she laughed. I couldn’t help but laugh with her, to which she would declare, “See. I told you it’s funny in Yiddish.”

My grandmother always believed another world was possible. It is this hope that inspires me to work in public schools in partnership with young people who have the potential to heal and transform our society.

Sophie lived to be almost ninety.

Getting Ready for Shabbat

The summer sun sets later and later
giving me more time to prepare.
I cut fresh flowers from the garden.
I rummage through the market
trying to decide what to make for dinner.
I fill my basket with heirloom tomatoes,
onions and garlic. I smirk, ironically
considering a pork tenderloin.
Come on, my husband’s name is Christopher.
Some Jews are Jewish without being religious.
I am religious without always being Jewish.
Being of many faiths is not much different
from being of one faith;
as I pick out strawberries and cilantro,
I know the world bends towards good.
At home, I cut the onions which make me cry.
I turn off the news, which also makes me cry.
Tonight, Yehuda half the people in the world love
the other half and I have to believe, half the people
hope for the other half. You come home
and we kiss under the mezuzah as if it were mistletoe.
Our daughter’s name is Hebrew for night,
which is almost here: a reprieve.
All week long moments stretch, strain and race.
Shabbat is Time’s chance to breathe,
it is our chance for gratitude
to be more prominent than obligation.
We set the table. We light the candles.
Later, we break the bread laughing
as our son gets the largest piece, again.
I lean across the table to feed you my piece
as you do the same—although it is only challah,
it tastes as sweet as wedding cake.
Grandma Norma, Identity Overlaps

My maternal grandmother is a reverent Lutheran woman. She is all straight lines: a farmer’s wife, a former one-room-schoolhouse teacher. My grandparents’ farm has been in our family for over a hundred years. Visits to Grandma Norma’s include church and shucking corn. My grandparents had been married for 56 years when my grandfather passed away.

Our lives are often marked by critical moments; my grandfather’s passing was such a moment. We were living in the Bay Area when we got the call. My husband, Chris had gone with me on a work conference in Northern California. As we drove back into the city, my phone rang. I was driving, so Chris answered. I could hear him talking to my mother. I could hear that something was wrong. I heard my mother say that she needed me, which I had never heard her say before. Chris hung up and gently told me that my grandfather had passed away. I pulled over on the bridge and bawled. The highway patrol stopped to see if we were okay, and when Chris told them what happened, they gave me space. I took the next flight out. There isn’t an airport near the farm so I had to fly into Minnesota. My dad met me. We rode back in the dark.

I helped my Grandma Norma get ready the next morning. She asked me if it would be okay if she wore a dress with flowers. “Your Grandpa always liked this dress.”

I had never seen Grandma Norma, the meat-and-potatoes woman of German/Swedish work ethic, like this. I told her the dress would be just fine. At the funeral she shared a poem she’d written for my grandfather, another surprise, another thing that sounded more like me.

After my grandfather passed away, I felt a new urgency to get to know my Grandma Norma. I now bring our children for visits more often. In the summer we’re able to stay for several days. My grandma and I sit together on the back porch and she tells me stories: stories
from her days in the one room schoolhouse, stories of my grandfather and stories from the farmhouse. I treasure these histories and the gift of passing them to our own children.

Mother as Autumn

Cool and manic, a bird
about to migrate south.
She is the place where
fronts collide--tornado
season. Cold days chill
to the soul, paint her
face red. I take her hand--
frost on a window sill.
Autumn has lived a half
a century in the Midwest.
Her eyes are the colors
of fire and cool. Her mania,
an apple tree. All I can do
is write of the blossoms.
Her forehead is lined
like her mother’s. My
sister’s is lined like hers.
Autumn is our birthright. I
climb behind the salty lines,
through the first snow, inside
her head--a wet cluttered field,
that smells of overcooked bread.
I am dizzy here, windblown,

rain washed, frozen. We
crawl into each other’s arms
and forget we’re being held.

Mother as Autumn, Explored

My parents met when my mother was still in college. It is a familiar story in our family. My parents were both science majors who sold antiques to pay the bills. They were at an auction. It started to rain. Everyone ran to duck under a nearby awning. My dad caught my mother’s eye and asked if she wanted to get something to eat. The must have fallen in love hard and fast. Three months later they were married. They just celebrated their thirty fifth wedding anniversary. My father, a dark skinned Jew from Brooklyn, and my mother a fair Lutheran farm girl from Iowa taught my sister and me that there are many ways to be a family.

Although she was a scientist by training, literature was an activity my mother and I enjoyed together the way other mothers and daughters did each other’s hair. A favorite childhood memory: stuck in gridlock traffic on the New Jersey Turnpike, my sister and I are sitting in the back of the van. My mother opens up Roald Dahl’s *Matilda* and reads us the entire novel.

I have never seen two people, who are not identical twins; resemble each other more than my mother and Grandma Norma. It is striking to see them together: the same straight lines: the same work ethic, the same chin. My sister and I carry some of this lineage. As a child, my mother and I were not close, which is not to say we did not love each other. We did, and do,
deeply. The women on my mother’s side of the family have an intensity that drives us to accomplish great things but that intensity can also drive us from each other. The shadow of mental health rests ever overhead. As a child I could not understand these things.

In college, my mother and I became friends. I lived in an apartment down the street from my parents. Later, Chris moved in with me. We walked home on Saturdays to have bagels with my parents and do our laundry. During the week I took my mother to events put on by the Women and Gender Studies Department. Through literature, time, and ideology my mother and I formed a deep relationship.

Chris and I were married young and moved to California two weeks after the wedding. When I said goodbye to my mother in their driveway, she and I wept and clung to each other with a fierceness that surprised us both. This soft vulnerability opened a door that’s stayed open ever since.

Five years later we moved back to the Midwest with a grandson for my parents.

Christmastime, A Love Poem

My father’s voice is all Brooklyn and cigarettes,
yet he hums “silent night” so sweetly.
The raspy feedback of a radio,
the smell of clementines on my fingers,
and I am six-years-old again, an anxious child at Christmastime.
Familiar things are warm:
the Swedish butter cookies
my son folds together on the cookie sheet;

the scratchy jazz holiday standards

my daughter loves. I turn them on and watch

her spin around in her socks like a wooden top,

round and round until her fine blond hair

is standing straight up from static.

The memory of my grandparents,

my grandfather’s fried turkey,

the crackers he would butter for me;

my grandmother’s Yiddish jokes,

the playing cards she used so often

ey they were as soft as cloth.

You.

Your warmth is familiar: I know

the precise moment in our sleep

when we can kick off the quilt, followed

by the moment we cool and reach

for each other in the dark, like slow clockwork;

your breath cupped in my freezing palms;

lines of our favorite poems whispered in my ear;

warmth that spreads from the inside out, painting

my chest and cheeks in a frosted blush.
We lay warm in our bed, the quilt at our feet.

In a moment our children will burst through
the door ready to race downstairs.

These are the stories that will grow old with us;
the familiar warmth of my own broken
carols, a sweet melody that returns
to our children on cold December nights.

Mother as Teacher, Pedagogies of Love

James was the best reader and most distracted child in my first class. He had deep
dimples when he smiled and introduced himself with a firm handshake. He was seven-years-old.
I was a brand new first grade teacher at a small K-8 school in East Oakland. One day at recess
James asked to talk to me in the very serious manner of small children. We sat in tiny plastic
kindergarten chairs and he asked if I would be his mom. James had spent his whole life in foster
care.

We went through the tedious foster-to-adopt process and learned how to be parents in a
trial by fire--as all parents do. Like all of the stories herein, this is one of healing. James is now
sixteen-years-old. He is over six foot tall, taking two honors classes, and running for our state
ranked cross country team. I teach at his high school. He likes to shout “I love you, Mom” before
running off with his friends.

Being a mother (and daughter and granddaughter) directly informs my practice as a
teacher. Lisa Delpit (1995) writes that powerful teachers refuse to treat their students as though
they are “other people’s children”. For me, excellence in teaching is a practice in mothering. I
conceptualize mothering as the feminist action of care. In the leadership literature, this is closely
linked to transformational leadership, a focus on sharing of power and compassionate concern for followers by acting in ways that show caring. (Kezar et al., 2006). Shields (2004) writes that “Educators must become transformative leaders, develop positive relationships with students such that children may bring their own lived experiences into the school and classroom, and facilitate moral dialogue.” (p. 113) When we base our pedagogy on strengthening our relationships with young people such that they are empowered to be change agents in their communities, the world begins to repair itself. I end with hope, that tikkun olam begins within each of us in the stories of our grandmothers.
References


ENGAGING IN EMANCIPATORY PRACTICES WITH THE SCHOOL LIBRARIAN, NOT THE KINKO’S GIRL
Julie Marie Frye, Sam Houston State University

The study examines novice librarians’ narratives of vulnerability and explores how participants perceived the influence of critical events on their occupational socialization. This study uses Performance MyStory, a performance based narrative inquiry tool. Given its roots in narrative therapy, Performance MyStory has the potential to not only reveal the occupational challenges of novice school librarians but also could serve as a formal, systematic method to educate women and alter their negative associations with critical, occupational events. This notion is not new to feminist scholars, as they recognize that “the telling of [critical event] stories can be empowering, validating the importance of the [storyteller’s] life experiences” (p. 2).

With two subjectivities involved, the researcher and the storyteller together weave a product (a transcript) that is by women. When completed with the hope to empower and validate women’s work and the emotions that accompany it, the product is not only by women, but also for women.

School Culture

During her first week on the job, Ginger faced an unexpected aspect of the school’s culture. At the all-staff meeting, the Superintendent introduced the concept of “Navajo Preference.” After the Superintendent’s greeting to the staff and before his words of inspiration for the school year, he informed the non-Navajo staff that they needed their jobs more than Red Rock Schools needed them. He explained the “privilege” the non-Navajo teachers had to work at the school. According to Ginger, this introduction to Navajo Preference created an intentional culture of fear among those who did not identify as Navajo. Ginger and her colleagues who did not identity as Navajo adopted an “under the radar” approach, which pushed Ginger’s initial instinct to listen first to an extreme, perhaps because “women’s socialization
encourages them to avoid conflict."xii Ginger recognized her outsider status and attempted to blend in. While she could not answer how or why “blending” became such a significant part of her existence, Ginger did recognize that it silently dominated her daily life.xiii

Ginger’s Critical Event

At the end of her second year at Red Rock, two incidents stimulated Ginger’s critical teaching event. First, a number of people, including the technology staff, took advantage of Ginger’s willingness to take on new responsibilities that others working in her position had not. Ginger felt abused because instead of collaborating with teachers, a few were dumping students in library for her to unexpectedly teach on her own. Next, the school’s grant writer received a large format printer. A few faculty and staff members informally told Ginger that the printer would be housed in the library, and that she would be responsible managing it. Before the printer arrived, Ginger questioned the relationship between her role as the school’s librarian and the management of the printer. She wondered why the administration automatically determined that managing the printer was her professional responsibility.

When the larger format printer arrived, the technology personnel set it up in the library. Ginger viewed this as an unexpected opportunity, because the technology personnel knew how to use the printer, and they used it in her space. However, they never invited Ginger to watch them use the printer nor did they offer to explain how to use it. Ginger realized that she could not manage the printer without having been trained how to use it; thus, she asked the technology personnel why they weren’t including her in the usage and training of the equipment.

When a technology employee told her the printer was “too complicated” for her to learn, she altered her plans to learn how to use the equipment.xiv Instead, on the last day of school, Ginger went to her supervisor and requested the printer be moved. Her administrator curtly
claimed that it was Ginger’s job as the library media specialist to manage the printer. This response led Ginger to resign immediately, because she had worked too hard to become an effective librarian only to be known as and treated like “the Kinko’s girl.”

To Ginger, her story was about a person or a group of people deciding what her responsibilities were without consulting her. Her frustration was that she was not respected enough to be consulted about the printer before it was ordered or set up. She also felt ignored when she finally “stood up for [her]self.”

**Professional Identity**

Ginger focused a great amount of import on her critical teaching event, and the vulnerability she experienced during this teaching event impacted her professional identity in a number of ways.

Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Identity claims about herself</th>
<th>Identity claims related to her needs from others</th>
<th>Identity claims related to work environments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“I am deserving of professional respect.” (10)</td>
<td>“I want to be supported.” (5)</td>
<td>“I want professional stability.” (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Others take advantage of me.” (6)</td>
<td>“I want to be accepted.” (2)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“I privately question authority.” (5)</td>
<td>“I want to be informed.” (1)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“I believe I can make a difference.” (4)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“I am solitary.” (2)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“I am professionally ambitious.” (2)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“I don’t know how to set professional boundaries.” (1)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“I want to do everything, but I get burned out.” (1)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“I do not always communicate my needs clearly.” (1)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

An entire year after the final encounter with her principal, she continued to question if being a school librarian was really the occupation for her. Although Ginger seemed determined...
at Red Rock to prove her teacher status and achieve professional respect, she was willing to give up her librarian title in order to free herself from the expectations of fulfilling clerical work by herself. Ginger no longer wanted to be a trailblazer for school librarians or school library programs on the Navajo reservation.

Ginger did leave the reservation and New Mexico, and she accepted a school librarian position at a prestigious charter school with a well-established school library.

Table 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I no longer identify with this claim, because I made a change.</th>
<th>I no longer identify with this claim, because a new school culture changed this for me.</th>
<th>I no longer identify with this claim, because a new administrator changed this for me.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Others take advantage of me.”</td>
<td>“Others take advantage of me.”</td>
<td>“I privately question authority.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“I don’t know how to set professional boundaries.”</td>
<td>“I don’t know how to set professional boundaries.”</td>
<td>“I don’t know how to set professional boundaries.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“I am solitary.”</td>
<td>“I want to do everything, but I get burned out.”</td>
<td>“I do not always communicate my needs clearly.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“I do not always communicate my needs clearly.”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Ginger struggled to recognize her involvement in the shift of her professional identity. What she saw instead was that she left a bad work environment in search of a good one. This caused Ginger initially to point to a new school culture and a new principal that instilled the changes in her identity. Her new school culture was collaborative, where teachers took responsibility for their students and their work. Staffed with a full-time clerk, Ginger no longer felt over-extended. In fact, she claimed to no longer have professional needs. She also believed that when a good administrator was in place, there was no need to question him privately.

With further storytelling, she did come to view herself as possessing limited abilities to change her professional identity:

I’ve thought a lot about how I have been running my current library. I am very
strict on rules such as food and drinks in the library. I think I will rethink that so
that more students will come in the library to use it. I’ve also realized that because
of my stressful environment [at Red Rock], that I tried very hard to protect the
library space [here]…Students do not come in to hang out.xix

Ginger’s experience at Red Rock pushed her to set strict professional boundaries to keep others
from taking advantage of her. In this case, her rules imposed restrictions on students – Ginger’s
former joy at Red Rock – instead of on those who previously took advantage of her (teachers or
technology staff). While Ginger did not identify with the stereotypical, rule-oriented librarian, it
was difficult to maintain her free spirit after her critical event.

However, Ginger mostly pointed to an external locus of control responsible for the
changes in her professional identity. She feared that if she returned to an abusive work
environment she would struggle with the same concerns and probably take on a similar
professional identity that she had at Red Rock. “It would repeat itself,” she said knowingly. “I’d
have to be stronger.”xx While Ginger saw her critical event as powerful enough to impel her to
resign, it was not powerful enough to change who she would be in another stressful work
environment.

Reproduction of Cultural Assumptions, Myths, and Stereotypes

Three assumptions from the culture of American schools played out in Ginger’s
narrative: (1) school librarians are clerical support staff; (2) those in authority don’t care for their
subordinates; and (3) once a superior makes a decision, the conversation is over. Because of
space limitations, only one of these is discussed.

The second cultural assumption that played out in Ginger’s story was that those in
authority do not care for their subordinates. Ginger’s administrator disregarded her position and
did not support her ideas. When Ginger expressed her desire to have the printer moved, her
administrator did not want to know why. Instead, she pushed all things media onto Ginger, and
strictly defined what Ginger would do. This administrator did not entertain questions and cut
short the conversation with top-down demands. Ginger imagined unsaid words from her
administrator in this way: “I’m in power, you’re not. I have all of this power. You’re just a
little person. I’m too busy for you. I’m big, you’re small.” Ginger saw her administrator
fixated on power, instead of focusing her energy on relationships with her subordinates.

The neglect for Ginger as a human being was also present in and outside her narrative.
For example, the administrator told Ginger that she could never take a sick day, because she
could not staff the library in her absence. Once, during a construction project at the school,
fumes filled the library. When Ginger finally convinced her to close the library for students’
safety, her administrator demanded that Ginger remain working in the toxic environment the rest
of the day. Throughout the construction project, Ginger was expected to breathe contaminated,
dusty air.

Significance of Participation in Study

Ginger attempted to put her critical moment behind her, and it was difficult for her to
write the first draft of her narrative. She claimed, “I didn’t want to go back to that moment and
remember how horrible I felt.” When she did begin drafting her narrative, she recalled being
“angry and wanting to scream just as I felt the day it happened. I wanted to go back to the school
and yell at the people who didn’t listen to me, and have them feel the way I felt.” Yet she
continued, because she wanted to share her story with future school librarians.

A week after finishing the first draft, Ginger moved from angry to reflective. She
remembered, “I began to process the situation over and over again, thinking about how I could
have handled the situation better.”xxiv Yet, her reflection led her right back to feelings of anger towards the administration and technology personnel. Later she questioned her rationality in the moment, and thought, “It was just a format printer!”xxv At other times, she wondered if she had experienced some kind of psychosis while working in the stressful environment. One moment she apologized for being emotional, and blamed it on her hormones. But the more she reflected, the more she realized that the critical event was not really about the format printer; it was about the return on her two-year investment at Red Rock. Ginger gave her best work in a school where the administrator never respected her role or fostered a culture of collaboration.

After performing her narrative, Ginger felt relieved and empowered. Her audience assured her that her feelings were not wrong, and she was not wrong to leave the school. They cited ways in which Ginger was strong, while before the performance Ginger had focused on the ways in which she was weak. She believed, “I felt that I could stand up for myself [and] that my feelings were legitimate. My job is legitimate.”xxvi Ginger claimed that performing the story and hearing the audience’s reactions gave her “closure. I definitely had angry feelings just lingering that I ignored, so [after the writing, performing, and discussion] I could move forward.”xxvii

Ginger also believed that the act of writing, performing, and discussing her critical event strengthened her resolve to communicate with her new supervisor. The day of her performance, the administrator gave Ginger a formal work performance evaluation. Ginger wondered how the principal could evaluate her if no observation had been done. Instead of just being content with a positive evaluation, Ginger set up an appointment and asked her administrator about the criteria she used to give her the performance evaluation. Without revisiting her story from Red Rock, Ginger claimed she would not have requested the meeting or formally questioned her administrator’s data collection procedures.
This is Ginger’s journey as a novice school librarian engaging in an emancipatory practice – sharing her critical, professional event by using the narrative inquiry tool Performance MyStory. No revolution has taken place here, but one woman has been “restore[d] to [her] lost dignity;” she has worked hard to consider ways to “reform [her]self” in her work as a school librarian and perhaps one day will] “reform the world.”

1 I conducted this study in order to address the following questions: (1) What challenges and successes do novice school librarians encounter or bring about as they enter the profession? (2) How do critical events create professional identities of school librarians (if at all)? (3) How do narratives of vulnerability (reproduce cultural myths about teaching and librarianship (if at all)? I wanted to understand the socialization process of novice school librarians and how participants viewed the role of Performance MyStory in their attempts to develop as professionals.

2 Performance MyStory involves the creation of one single, autobiographical narrative to explain an existential crisis, significant turning point, or noteworthy experience in life. After dramaturgically describing the moment and fashioning it into a text, the writer performs the narrative in front of an audience. At the end of the performance, the researcher facilitates a discussion between the audience and the writer through a series of questions. From this discussion, the writer recognizes the cultural representations and voices that define the experience. After the performance, the writer reflects on the deconstruction of the narrative and lessons learned by producing another written text.


4 Ginger Allenby in discussion with the author, April 12, 2012.

5 Ginger Allenby in discussion with the author, April 12, 2012.


7 Ginger showed up on the Navajo reservation excited to give all that she had to the students and the community, but she recognized her outsider status. She wanted to show respect to the community. She remembered her thoughts in this way: “I wanted to be silent…I wanted to listen…That’s what I learned in Tuvalu is to listen to people. Know what they want from you” (April 12, 2012).


9 Ginger Allenby in discussion with the author, April 10, 2012.


12 Table 1: Throughout her critical event narrative, Ginger revealed explicit, implicit, and tacit identity claims. Table 1 categorizes these identity claims. Next to each claim is a numerical value that corresponds to the number of times Ginger claimed it. Neither the superintendent nor the principal were interviewed as a part of this study. Instead, this chapter relies on Ginger’s stories of occupational socialization.

13 According to Ginger, if there were two candidates applying for a job with the same qualifications on the reservation, the Navajo candidate would always get the job.

14 Ginger Allenby in discussion with the author, April 12, 2012.

15 Ginger Allenby in discussion with the author, April 12, 2012.


17 Ginger Allenby in discussion with the author, April 10, 2012.

18 Ginger Allenby in discussion with the author, April 11, 2012.

19 Ginger Allenby in discussion with the author, April 11, 2012.

20 Ginger Allenby in discussion with the author, April 12, 2012.

21 Table 2: A year and a half after her critical event, Ginger was able to point out the altered identity claims and to whom or what she attributed the shift in her professional identity. These are arranged and labeled in table 2.


23 Ginger Allenby in discussion with the author, December 18, 2012.

24 Ginger Allenby in discussion with the author, April 11, 2012.


35 Mary Wollstonecraft, A Vindication of the Rights of Woman, with Structures on Political and Moral Subjects (London: T.F. Unwin, 1891), 84.
REPRODUCTIVE HEALTH CARE EDUCATION FOR VULNERABLE POPULATIONS:
EDUCATING INCARCERATED WOMEN AND WOMEN AT-RISK OF INCARCERATION
ON THE IMPORTANCE OF PREVENTATIVE AND REHABILITATIVE MEASURES
RESPECTIVE OF ONE’S CULTURAL, GENDER, AND SEXUAL IDENTITY

Kayley Gillespie
Human Relations Graduate Student
University of Oklahoma

Introduction

Research has shown when incarcerated women or those who are at-risk of incarceration are given access to reproductive health education and care, unplanned and high-risk pregnancies can be prevented, education can be implemented to teach underprivileged women about contraception, those who wouldn’t have access because of socioeconomic barriers can receive access, the high cost of pre- and post-natal care and prison nurseries can be decreased, opportunities to better train health care providers arise, and better policy to care for incarcerated women and women at-risk of incarceration can be crafted. The demographics describing incarcerated women and women at-risk of incarceration have prompted researchers to discuss the possible social issues and externalities associated with women who do not or cannot receive contraception, either because of lack of knowledge or lack of access. Simply, in the same way schools and communities can provide educational programming by providing students and community members with information, resources, and perhaps contraceptives, correctional facilities have the potential to do more than confine offenders.

Repositioning Reproductive Health within Education

An overview. Effective applications of sexual health may decrease epidemics such as HIV and AIDS, STDs, viral hepatitis, teen and unintended pregnancy, and sexual violence.\(^1\) It is important to note that sexual health education, namely reproductive health education, is not
simply the absence of disease, as originally articulated by the World Health Organization in 1975.ii Rather, according to the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention and the Health Resources and Services Administration Advisory Committee on HIV, Viral Hepatitis, and STD Prevention and Treatment, “Sexual health is a state of well-being in relation to sexuality across the life span that involves physical, emotional, mental, and spiritual dimensions...based on a positive, equitable, and respectful approach to sexuality, relationships and reproduction that is free of coercion, fear, discrimination, stigma, shame, and violence.”iii

Secondary schools are often the first and only venue for individuals to receive reproductive health education. Between 1996 to 2010, the United States government invested over $1 billion in abstinence-only reproductive education for public schools.iv Currently, 37 states require abstinence programing be provided in sex education courses, with 25 states requiring that abstinence be stressed,v despite data which suggests increasing emphasis on abstinence education is positively correlated with teenage pregnancy and birth rates.vi, vii The pushback to provide comprehensive reproductive education persists, as only 20 states and the District of Columbia mandate both sex education and HIV education, only 13 states require sex and HIV education programs be medically accurate, only 18 states and the District of Columbia require that information on contraception be provided, and only nine states require that discussion of sexual orientation be inclusive.viii As public schools become instruments that best serve political interests rather than students’ interests, community reproductive education programming lacks the funding, manpower, and access of convenience that schools receive.

If accurate and appropriate reproductive health education is not received in schools, it is likely not received at all, especially within low-income communities.ix Clinics like Planned Parenthood and non-school programs like The Religious Coalition for Reproductive Choice,
Spiritual Youth for Reproductive Freedom, and the Association of Reproductive Health Professionals offer educational programming, but cannot realistically reach individuals of reproductive age within the same scope as schools. Community programmers face obstacles such as how to evaluate community participation, whether by changes in community self-efficacy or changes in local capacity to identify and solve problems. Legislation like the Real Education for Health Youth Act of 2013, which seeks to support a comprehensive, evidence-based sex education programs in the U.S. and plans to award five-year grants to educational agencies, tribal organizations, state or local departments of health or education, non-profits, or hospitals, support community programming but have been met with opposition and seldom moved past assignment to a congressional committee. The lack of effective reproductive health education and funding hinders vulnerable individuals’ ability to seek reproductive health care and individuals become inundated with misinformation and misconceptions, and lack information about where to find services. One cannot pursue a service about which they know nothing.

**Institutional and Community Partnerships**

Effective sexual health programming has been noted to holistically emphasize an individual’s right and responsibility to make healthy choices via a health-promotion model. Notable programs include those modeled after the U.S. Navy’s Sexual Health and Responsibility Program (SHARP), as well as the Oregon Youth Sexual Health Plan. SHARP collaborates with Navy experts in women’s health, preventative medicine, and HIV care including technical details, surveillance objectives and systems, and priority outcome objectives, in addition to partnering with the Center for Disease Control and Prevention, national women’s health organizations, and national unplanned pregnancy prevention associations to determine scientific evidence that supports effectiveness and replicable models. Likewise, the Oregon
Youth Sexual Health Plan, though implemented within public schools, relies on community engagement, and found presenting youth sexual health as an issue encompassing physical, emotional, mental, and social well-being allowed community organizations to examine their role in the initiative, even if sexual health was not primary to their mission.\textsuperscript{xvi} It takes a village to deliver relevant and effective reproductive health programming and because vulnerable populations often lack support systems and communities advocating on their behalf, it is imperative vulnerable individuals receive appropriate reproductive health education and care at critical times in their life. For many, this is during intake within correctional facilities.

\textbf{Qualifications of Vulnerable Populations}

For the purpose of this paper, vulnerable individuals are as defined as those with at least one incarcerated parent, who are or have been incarcerated themselves, who live in poverty, who lack the political will to advocate for better access to reproductive health education and care, or those who lack the ability to advocate for their personal safety. One cannot begin discussing the incarcerated female population without first discussing the conditions that position individuals within the criminal justice system. Women who enter the criminal justice system are more likely than ever before to do so because of drug or property offences.\textsuperscript{xvii} These non-violent offenders are more likely to come from poverty, have a history of physical, emotional, or sexual abuse, have a history of drug abuse, grow up in insecure housing or have a history of homelessness, and, perhaps as a result, lack adequate and consistent education.\textsuperscript{xvii, xix, xx} Women and young girls with such qualifications oftentimes find their basic needs unmet and are more occupied with securing housing, employment and sustenance than seeking information about reproductive health. Even if vulnerable individuals are in school during the time of reproductive health education, they may be the recipients of ineffective, abstinence-only reproductive health
education, as recent literature suggests low-income women are more likely to have feelings of regret, uncertainty, or both regret and uncertainty as opposed to satisfaction when describing school-based reproductive health education\textsuperscript{xxi}.

In the same way schools and communities can provide educational programming by providing students and community members with information, resources, and perhaps contraceptives, correctional facilities have the potential to do more than confine offenders. Programming may be modeled after existing programs both inside and outside correctional facilities. Just as studies show that those who abuse substances are likely to repeat behaviors that led to their criminal justice status (hence the need for drug rehabilitation programs),\textsuperscript{xxii} those who lack reproductive education and care are likely to continue to participate in sexual risk-taking that may lead to unintended pregnancies, HIV or STDs, or an unhealthy relationship that lacks a power balance.

The challenge within resituating correctional facilities as educational institutions lies not within programming classes or recruiting students, but within logistics and delivery. According to the National Survey of Criminal Justice Treatment Practices, while substance abuse education and awareness is offered in 74% of prisons, 61% of jails, and 53% of community agencies, for example, it is offered to a relatively small number of the eight million adults within the correctional system.\textsuperscript{xxiii} About 109,000 prisoners, 86,000 jail detainees, and 331,000 individuals under community supervision receive substance abuse education each day, revealing many individuals sit on a waiting list for services.\textsuperscript{xxiv} For this reason, about 60% of parole and probation agencies and about a third of jails report making community-based treatment referrals for offenders. Unfortunately, few prisons report having the ability to make community-based treatment referrals.\textsuperscript{xxv} Correctional facilities could feasibly offer reproductive health education
and care both within the facility and on a referral basis for non-violent offenders with short-term sentences exclusively. Such programming could be modeled after the way in which many facilities currently deal with substance abuse education.

**Programming Respective of One’s Gender-, Cultural-, and Sexual-Identity**

Offering effective reproductive health education and care to individuals within jails and prisons to individuals who fall between the cracks of school and community programming is important in order to produce an autonomous society that is health-literate, but education should be delivered in a sensitively. One must keep in mind that incarcerated women not only come from all walks of life, but each may have an abusive past marked by trauma. Reproductive health education should be aware of possible triggers via past experiences, as well as one’s cultural-, racial-, and sexual-identity.

Programming respective of one’s culture is important because the way in which one relates to reproductive health and care may depend highly on one’s culture. Recent literature suggests Latina women highly prioritize their parents’ views of reproductive health, with some internalizing their parents’ beliefs of virginity and self-worth and the idea that conversations about sex and reproductive health services encourages sexual activity and promiscuity.\textsuperscript{xxvi} Additionally, Caal et al. (2013) found first-generation Americans may not recognize reproductive health services are different in the U.S. than in Mexico. Mexican immigrants in another study did not have a consistent sexual reproductive health provider because they did not know about clinics and received misinformation about Medicaid coverage.\textsuperscript{xxvii} While the reviewed literature focuses on Mexican-American experiences, these themes can be applied to other cultures.
Literature also suggests one’s preferences in decision making in relation to reproductive health care may vary by age, education, income, and race. Older, less educated, lower income, and African American patients were found to be more likely to prefer less involvement in decision-making with their health care provider about contraception.\textsuperscript{xxviii} This may make certain individuals less likely to be receptive to reproductive health education and counseling. Literature suggested decision-making about contraception was viewed differently than decision-making about general health,\textsuperscript{xxix} suggesting reproductive health education and care is a sensitive and personal issue for women depending on the intersectionalities of their identity.

While reproductive health educational programming must consider the range of preferences in involvement with health care providers and individual experiences, it must also recognize the gender spectrum. Clinicians should recognize the heteronormative paternalistic 12-step programming designed by and for males may discount various female experiences. That is, education and programming must resist a binary model and must consider the range of gender identities and be sensitive and responsive to all experiences.\textsuperscript{xxx}

**Incarcerated Female Experiences**

The subsequent sections describe characteristics of and the conditions under which incarcerated women exhibit and endure, though these qualifiers also describe many women who are at-risk of incarceration. While the following is not an exhaustive list of qualities that substantiate reproductive health education and care, as each woman’s situation and life experience is individualized, it is meant to tease out commonalities shared between vulnerable populations that necessitate reproductive health education and care.

**Increase in Incarceration Necessitates Reproductive Health Programming**
The number of incarcerated women increased by 153% from 1990 to 2009, a statistic which represents a mostly nonviolent prison population arrested for drug and property offenses. By the end of 2005, more than 1.2 million women were in custody, and by the end of 2008, more than two million women were in custody, mostly in jails and prisons, but also on parole or probation. Approximately 2.6 million women are incarcerated annually, and many women in jail reenter the community within months of their arrest. While the female population in contact with the criminal justice system is increasing, minorities of low socioeconomic backgrounds represent the majority of a growing prison population. Private prisons that profit from mass incarceration and harsh drug policies like mandatory minimum sentences and three-strikes laws are increasing incarceration rates dramatically, despite the fact that violent crime rates have reached historic lows, according to the FBI.

Demographics: Minority, Underprivileged Women

Women of color represent the majority of the national prison population. At mid-year 2009, one in every 200 Black women, one in every 704 Hispanic women, and one in every 1,099 White women was incarcerated. Because the majority of incarcerated women hail from poor and disadvantaged communities, many enter the criminal justice system with a lack of health care prior to imprisonment. Incarcerated women’s age and poor state of physical and mental health make them candidates for reproductive education and elective contraceptive use.

Reproductive Age

Women of reproductive age represent a large proportion of incarcerated women, though little research focuses on reproductive health care—contraception, especially—for female incarcerates. About 70% of incarcerated women are between the ages of 18 to 39 years. These women characteristically have high-risk, unplanned pregnancies. Evidence suggests
between six to 10% of the female prison population is pregnant with 1,400 births each year, creating a need for reproductive health education and contraceptive during one’s sentence.\textsuperscript{xii}

**Unplanned Pregnancies: Physical and Mental Health**

Incarcerated females are likely to have high-risk, unplanned pregnancies due to a lack of health care prior to imprisonment, substance abuse, and poor mental health. Many female prisoners are from poor and disadvantaged communities and are unable to attend to chronic physical health problems like asthma, hypertension, diabetes, and heart disease.\textsuperscript{xiii} Additionally, many incarcerated women experience mental health disorders like mania, anxiety, major depression, personality disorders, psychotic disorders, substance abuse, and dependence.\textsuperscript{xiii} Recent literature suggests women who experience post-traumatic stress disorder due to childhood trauma are more likely to exhibit low-self esteem, depression, and experience functional difficulties.\textsuperscript{xiii} Some estimates suggest incarcerated women have higher rates of mental health disorders than do incarcerated men,\textsuperscript{xiv} with 73% of females versus 55% of males experiencing mental illness in state prisons and 75% of females versus 63% of males experiencing mental illness in local jails.\textsuperscript{xiv} Women who do not attend to chronic health problems are unlikely to be proactive in other areas of health, including reproductive health.

Because many incarcerated women are predisposed to have mental health maladies, contraceptive counseling and use may combat rape and coercion during and after incarceration. According to Walsh et al., (2012), “Women who have difficulty regulating unpleasant internal emotions may be so depleted in the face of negative emotions that they have few resources available to identify environmental risk cues and engage in assertive or escape-focused behavior,” \textsuperscript{xiv} That is, they don’t know the red flags and they are unable to stand up for themselves and seek help. Potential perpetrators may identify vulnerable women who are visibly
distressed, confused, or disoriented. Additionally, empirical research suggests that women who are unable to identify and label emotional experiences tend to have higher rates of sexual revictimization. Such women lack the mental health and autonomy to advocate on their behalf for reproductive health education and contraception access.

**Unplanned Pregnancies: Sexual Risk Taking**

In addition to physical and mental health issues, sexual risk taking also contributes to unplanned and high risk pregnancies among incarcerated females. About 77% of incarcerated women in one study considered themselves very likely or extremely likely to have sex with a man within six months of prison release, about 36% used contraception inconsistently and seven percent had not used contraception. About 62% of the women from the study were nonwhite, about 83% were single, and over half of the women reported a history of a gynecological infection. Such rates echo national statistics on the demographics and reproductive health of female incarcerates.

A similar study found incarcerated women report low contraceptive use and high rates of unplanned pregnancies. About 61% of incarcerated women who had entered San Francisco County Jail within a 24-hour period had not used contraception within the last year, 63% had at least one child in the past year, and 54% had a history with abortion. Despite the entry statistics, 45% of the women wanted to use contraception upon release from jail, though 15% did not know where to obtain it post-release. Of the women surveyed, 84% were members of a racial or ethnic minority, suggesting that some members of minority communities are unequipped with the knowledge and resources to obtain contraception.

In a parallel study, researchers from the same San Francisco County Jail surveyed women who had been in jail for 24 hours or less. This study found 29% of the women surveyed qualified
for emergency contraception. That is, 29% of the women surveyed were not pregnant, had engaged in heterosexual intercourse in the last five days, and did not use an intact condom during each sexual encounter. Almost half of the women who qualified for emergency contraception were willing to take it if offered, while 71% would accept an advance supply of emergency contraception upon release. Forty-four percent of the emergency contraceptive-eligible women reported drug or alcohol abuse during the last five days of unprotected sex, in alignment with national statistics that suggest incarcerated women have both a history of mental illness and unplanned pregnancies. Because drug and alcohol abuse complicates a potential pregnancy, contraception and proactive reproductive education programs may lower health risks.

Unplanned Pregnancies: Substance Abuse

Risky sexual behavior is oftentimes laced with drug or alcohol abuse, as indicated by various research. For example, 66% of incarcerated women surveyed in one study engaged in sex work within the last three months and about 68% of those women had used cocaine at least once during that period. Almost 90% of women surveyed met standards for a diagnosis of lifetime alcohol dependence. On average, incarcerated women were sexually active on about 44% of at-risk days and reported using alcohol on an average of 52% of days. Though women who did not use condoms while sober also did not use them while drinking, the data suggests that alcohol increases sexual activity and heightens the chances for unprotected sex. Drug abuse and alcohol abuse puts at-risk women in situations hazardous to their reproductive health and well-being, including exposing at-risk women to lack of employment, homelessness, and sex trade.

Contraception to Prevent STIs

Though contraception has so far been discussed within the scope of preventing high-risk pregnancies, both fertile and sterilized women are susceptible to STIs and HIV. One study
among incarcerated women 18 to 44 years old suggested sterilized women are less likely to use condoms to prevent STIs, more likely to have an HIV positive partner, and more likely to be HIV positive themselves.\textsuperscript{lxiv} STIs rates have reached epidemic levels, with rates in prisons and jails 12 to 16 times higher than in the general population.\textsuperscript{lxv} There may be a correlation between low-income communities and lack of STI knowledge, as schools that fail to provide effective reproductive health programming may result in students seeking information from unreliable sources, which may result in disjointed, inaccurate information.\textsuperscript{lxvi} Pruitt et al. (2010) recommend jail and treatment center programs create an educational atmosphere that focuses on disease prevention and contraception use.

\textbf{Treatment Center Programs}

Because women are often housed in correctional facilities with predominately male populations, health services tailored to women’s needs may be limited.\textsuperscript{lxvii, lxviii} Historically, treatment and training programs for incarcerated women are poorer in quantity, quality, and variety,\textsuperscript{lxix} and women are traditionally excluded from halfway house programs, work release programs, and furloughs.\textsuperscript{lxx} Clinicians acknowledge correctional facilities are inherently unbalanced, unequal, and potentially abusive,\textsuperscript{lxxi} further necessitating the need to reevaluate the health programming women receive and resituate correctional facilities as valuable educational institutions. In the same way correctional facilities offer drug rehabilitation programming, they could also offer voluntary reproductive health education. The U.S. Department of Justice realizes the value within community-based alternatives for non-violent offenders, as it has pledged funding for research on possible community-based programs that focus on education and rehabilitation.\textsuperscript{lxxii} What is more, recent literature suggests incarcerated women are open to productive and educational programming.
According to a case study which interviewed multiple women post-incarceration to gauge their ideas and feelings once released from a correctional facility, many participants said their jail time could have been better utilized had there been programs to help them address problems in and outside of prison. One woman with a drug addiction wished she could have used her time in jail better, at least to reduce the likelihood to recidivate, “’cause there certainly isn’t any programs in the streets. Now I’m back where I started.” Another woman described the difficulties she encountered after being medicated and released from jail, not knowing how to seek medical help on her own. According to the recently-released woman, “I don’t know what medicine they were giving me, so I can’t get a refill. I don’t have a doctor, I don’t have any money, and I don’t know what to do.” Another woman, in need of transitional programming and a treatment facility, candidly expressed her frustration with the lack of programming she received in the correctional facility. Instead of learning how to avoid the people, places, and things that brought her to jail in the first place, she went “right back out to the streets that led [her] there in the first place.” If women were taught how to be autonomous beings while incarcerated – including how to take control of their reproductive health – perhaps they would be less likely to rely on dangerous systems once they were released from jail or prison.

**Recidivism**

Reproductive health education is necessary at all levels of correctional facilities, but may be most effective at the local level. Research suggests that high recidivism rates, especially at the local level, create a need for contraceptive access among the incarcerated female population. In keeping with national statistics, the majority of women at the Women’s Facility at the Adult Correction Institute in Rhode Island, for example, are committed for a short time and return to the community within 30 days. Fewer than 25% of commitments translate to sentences and
45% of sentences are less than 6 months. Sufrin, Crenin, and Chang (2009) suggest providing contraception to short-commit women before they reenter the community could alleviate the externalities associated with sexual risk-taking and high-risk pregnancies, especially overall health care costs.

**Inconsistencies with recidivism and health care**

Offering reproductive health education and care to female incarcerates who reenter the community may prevent correction facilities from coordinating emergency contraception or abortion services if women reenter the criminal justice system. Though Medicaid pays for women’s abortions in certain circumstances which vary by state – from very restrictive policies that pay for abortions only if a woman’s life is endangered, to the least restrictive policies that pay for all “medically necessary” abortions – some facilities do not provide transportation to the abortion clinic and many incarcerated women must schedule appointments without help from correctional health providers. Additionally, 14 states out of 44 states surveyed in 2009 did not have an official written policy on incarcerated women who requested abortions. This leads much of the process to individual discretionary power, which can not only vary by state and facility, but by correctional health providers.

Contraception and preventative measures are supported by various advocacy agencies because the paperwork involved in obtaining a court order to receive an abortion many times meets procedural delays that take a woman too far into her first term to receive an abortion. What’s more, a full-term pregnancy in a correctional facility oftentimes means the woman will give birth in shackles, since only 18 states have prohibited shackling pregnant women before, during, and after labor by law. Despite the Eighth Amendment, which protects an inmate’s right to adequate medical care, and the Fourteenth Amendment, which establishes a woman’s
right to privacy and elective abortions via Roe v. Wade, many correctional facilities fail to follow through with effective policies and statues that would either prevent a pregnancy or terminate a pregnancy within legal specifications.\textsuperscript{lxxxiii}

\textbf{Recidivism and Motivational Interviewing}

There is a study being conducted which seeks to dispense contraception to recently released incarcerated females and track their progress in three month intervals until the one year release date. The team will use motivational interviewing to increase the initiation and continuation of highly effective contraception. Previous motivational interviewing experiments have initiated significantly higher rates of condom use (from 22\% to 66\%) and fewer reports of unprotected sex compared to control groups.\textsuperscript{lxxxiv} Though recruitment for the trial has recently ended and research findings have not been published, that Clark, Gold, Simon, Roberts, and Stein recognize the importance of administering contraception upon community reentry and monitoring the use and progress during timeframes women recidivate is helpful to the research community. Policymakers and advocates look to the research community to legislate and advocate on behalf of the incarcerated community.

\textbf{Contraception for in-Jail Experiences}

While previous research has demonstrated the need for contraception counseling as incarcerated women reenter the community, Pardue, Arrigo, and Murphy (2011) indicate the necessity for contraception while incarcerated due to prison staff and inmate relationships. The Prison Rape Elimination Act of 2003 has only curbed coercion between convicts and staff members, but it cannot completely eliminate victimization or the deprivation an inmate experiences that facilitates sexual bartering and exploitation in exchange for goods and services.\textsuperscript{lxxxv}
In 2007, federal and state prison staff were involved in an estimated 22,600 instances of unwilling sexual activity.\textsuperscript{lxxxvi} Struckman-Johnson and Struckman-Johnson found up to 27\% of female inmates experienced sexual coercion, with half of the assaults perpetrated by male correctional officers.\textsuperscript{lxxxvii} Additionally, a quarter of women who reported sexual coercion reported oral, anal, or vaginal rape.\textsuperscript{lxxxviii} Despite statistics extrapolated from various studies, the fact that few studies discuss the risks of prison sexual victimization indicate the need for prevention programs that include reproductive health education and contraceptive counseling.\textsuperscript{lxxxix}

\textbf{In the Oklahoma Headlines}

The following headlines appeared in Oklahoma news recently. The first, “McLoud prison guards accused of groping, having sex with female inmates” was reported in Nov. 2012.\textsuperscript{xc} Corrections officers, Jamie Baker and Richard DeHaven, of Mabel Basset Correctional Center, are accused of groping and having sex with female prisoners. The second headline, “Lawsuit accuses wardens of allowing sexual assaults at Oklahoma women’s prison,” details that 11 women are pressing charges against three of the guards for sexual assault.\textsuperscript{xci} They also claim administrators failed to fix security cameras that would have captured the acts. Note that of the three correctional officers, Juber, was disciplined in 2009 for exchanging sexually-explicit letters with a female inmate at Mabel Basset. He was suspended for two days without pay. Baker was previously ordered to undergo a psychiatric evaluation for sexual misconduct, anger management, and interpersonal relationships in May 2007. While these correctional officers have a history of sexual offenses, it should also be noted that a 2012 U.S. Department of Justice report documented 15.3\% of inmates at Mabel Bassett Correctional Center reported sexual abuse or rape from another inmate—double the national average of inmate-on-inmate sexual violence—
suggesting a lack of oversight and a need for sexual and reproductive health education programming for both employees and inmates.\textsuperscript{xcii}

\textbf{Justice Department Study}

A Justice Department study published January 2014 that details sexual victimization reported nationally from 2009-2011 found that correctional officers are responsible for half of sex abuse allegations and that more than half of allegations are dismissed by prison officials as “unfounded” or “unsubstantiated.” Only about ten percent of allegations are substantiated by an investigation. Even when there is evidence that the alleged sexual abuse occurred by a correctional officer, the correctional officer is rarely prosecuted. Most prison staff shown to be involved in sexual misconduct lose their jobs only. Fewer than half are referred for prosecution. Only one percent are convicted. One-third of staff are allowed to resign before the investigation closes, meaning there’s no public record of what exactly transpired and nothing preventing them from getting a similar job at another facility.\textsuperscript{xciii}

According to the report, females account for a greater proportion of victims of staff-on-inmate victimization than they do the overall inmate population. Females account for seven percent of sentenced prison inmates, nationally, but 33\% of all victims of staff-on-inmate sexual victimization in federal and state prisons.\textsuperscript{xciv} Similarly, females represent only 13\% of inmates in local jails, but 67\% of all victims of staff-on-inmate victimization.\textsuperscript{xcv}

\textbf{Paying for Reproductive Health Care in Jail: Co-Payments}

Though contraception may be available at some correctional facilities, contraceptives and counseling programs have not previously effectively reached and treated incarcerated women because of the burdens co-payments impose. Under the Affordable Care Act, states that expanded the Medicaid eligibility program granted eligibility to all adults within the poverty
threshold, including prison and jail inmates so long as they had a social security number, so women can have access to the full range of FDA-approved methods without a co-pay. Despite the lack of female-specific literature on Medicaid use within jails or prisons after the implementation of the Affordable Care Act, health experts estimate up to 35% of individuals who are newly eligible for Medicaid are individuals with histories of criminal justice involvement, including current inmates and those on parole or probation.

Even though the Affordable Care Act lifted barriers for many within the criminal justice system, these new avenues of access mean nothing if individuals do not know how to access them. Many incarcerated women may understand they still have to pay co-pays for inpatient and outpatient care, operating within an old framework described by Fisher and Hatton (2010). In California, incarcerated women employed within the correctional facility earn an average of seven to 13 cents per hour, though co-payments are between $2 to $10 for each visit with a doctor or nurse (2010). An inmate earning seven cents per hour would work for nine days to pay a $5 co-payment – the equivalent of an individual who makes $60,000 annually paying $2,000 for a co-payment. Many women forego treatment because they must put their earnings toward restitution, bus fare or housing costs once released, or simply because they don’t have the money or they don’t want to invest so much money in health services.

**Children Born in Correctional Facilities**

Without proper contraception, the six to ten percent of the incarcerated female population will continue to give birth in correctional facilities. Incarcerated women who are many times separated from their infants within hours of giving birth do not only report feelings of separation and anger, but retrospectively report the separation between them and their infants was the most traumatic aspect of incarceration. Though Byrne et al. (2009) found mothers in a prison nursery
were capable of raising infants who are severely attached to them at rates comparable to healthy children born to mothers outside the prison system, nurseries are not yet fixtures of prisons. Only nine states have prison nursery programs in place, each with varying eligibility requirements, numbers of staff devoted to the program, and maximum length of stay stipulations.\textsuperscript{cii} Despite the low number of nursery programs, research has shown that prison nurseries reduce recidivism rates, prevent children from entering foster care, and facilitates mother-child bonding.\textsuperscript{ciii}

Though prison nurseries and similar programs would help incarcerated women who are new mothers retain a more favorable mental state and decrease recidivism, these programs are not widely accepted and funded. Kubiak, Kasiborski and Schmitte1 (2010) conducted an experiment in which a treatment group of incarcerated women entered a community based program called Women and Infants at Risk (WIAR). The intervention program allowed women with nonviolent offenses to leave prison before their third trimester for a secure residential facility where they would reside with their infant for four months.\textsuperscript{civ}

Women in the intervention group were less likely to have an arrest post-birth and less likely to be convicted post-birth, compared to the control group.\textsuperscript{cv} Prison nurseries in the nine practicing states have shown to be just as effective. While about 30\% of women who delivered while incarcerated in the Nebraska Correctional Center for Women in the four years before the nursery’s institution were arrested within three years of release, only nine percent of nursery participants were arrested within the first five years of the nursery program.\textsuperscript{cvi} The WIAR intervention program suggests the difficulties in keeping children from their incarcerated mothers, especially since women are more likely than men to be sole caregivers of minor children.\textsuperscript{cvii} Despite low recidivism rates and healthy, high-functioning children, policymakers
cite concerns about security, program management, liability, and potential adverse effects the prison environment will have on a child.\textsuperscript{cviii}

**Bias Encountered during in-Jail Pregnancy**

A case study profiling the bias one pregnant incarcerated woman encountered throughout her pregnancy exemplifies the discretionary power prison officials, social workers, nurses, and doctors hold in reproductive decisions despite policy, evidence, and research.\textsuperscript{cix} The pregnant incarcerated woman, referred to as Jane, was never informed of the date of time of her doctor appointments for security reasons, which prevented her from compiling questions or preparing emotionally for the examinations.\textsuperscript{cx} The staff at a perinatal home visiting agency (PHVA) – an entity separate from the criminal justice system acting as Jane’s advocate – informed Jane she could keep custody of her child for 18 months.\textsuperscript{cxi} Jane’s social worker, on the other hand, did not only withhold information about Jane’s parental rights, but, along with prison guards, encouraged Jane to “give up” the child.\textsuperscript{cxii}

Doctors did not endorse Jane’s plans to breastfeed because of Jane’s Methadone maintenance for her recovering heroin addiction and they threatened to report her to Child Protective Services.\textsuperscript{cxiii} Despite threats from medical professionals, the PHVA staff determined through research that Jane was legally allowed to breastfeed without repercussions.\textsuperscript{cxiv} After the birth, PHVA staff learned that Jane’s nursery application was revoked. Initially, Jane’s social worker said her baby didn’t fit the qualifications of a “well baby,” and Jane’s stepmother retained guardianship.\textsuperscript{cxv} Later, social workers claimed there was a misunderstanding and that the nursery application was accepted. Days later, Jane received an official prison document stating the application was denied. What’s more, a social worker at the state prison told PHVA staff they could not “baby sit” Jane’s child.\textsuperscript{cxvi} In Jane’s case – and like many other cases throughout the
country – the lack of specific state or federal legal guidelines and abusive discretionary power allowed for the dissemination of misinformation and bias in Jane’s care.

**Why We Should Care**

Many women who lack contraception knowledge or access become severely disenfranchised while incarcerated. Many decisions are left up to the individuals who are in charge of the organization of the facility – prison officials, social workers, nurses and doctors who may be over worked, under paid, and who may not be held accountable for their actions, due to lack of policy, funding, and oversight. This discretionary power is dangerous.

Vulnerable individuals can seldom advocate for themselves. Aside from mental and emotional factors that may prevent women from moving for change, may do not know how. Others are unable by law. Only Maine and Vermont allow individuals with a felony to vote by absentee ballot while in prison. Most states (20), including Oklahoma, restore one’s vote after the incarceration, parole, and probation term has ended. Eleven states may take one’s vote permanently depending on the state, crime, time elapsed since completion of the sentence, and other factors. In Kentucky, for example, one’s vote is restored only after the governor approves an application. In Virginia, non-violent felons must have paid all court costs, fines, and any restitution. This proves to be impossible for many, since finding employment and housing is difficult for previously incarcerated individuals.

**Conclusion**

Incarcerated women and women at-risk of incarceration seldom receive effective reproductive health education and care because their schools deliver unrealistic programming, their communities lack funding, and systematic forms of oppression and disadvantaged circumstances often prescribe above average high school dropout rates, poor health outcomes,
homelessness, substance abuse and dependency, physical, mental, or sexual abuse, high-risk sexual activity, wages below the poverty threshold, and many other circumstances. Once women enter the criminal justice system, many women lack support and advocates in a system designed with the male offender in mind only.\textsuperscript{cxviii} Research by Garcia and Lane (2013) suggests that since females differ from males on a psychological, developmental, and social level, gender-specific intervention, correctional, and preventative programs should be instituted. Rehabilitative educational programs should capitalize on the opportunity to teach women about reproductive health education and provide resources and referrals to women in need. Perhaps identifying the paths to delinquency and providing preventative measures like reproductive health education and contraceptive counseling before young girls enter such paths and early in the criminal justice process can prevent the health risks, social ramifications, reproductive justice and human rights violations, and other measurable and immeasurable externalities.

\textsuperscript{ii} Ibid
\textsuperscript{iii} Ibid, p. 1
\textsuperscript{viii} State Policies, \textit{Guttmacher Institute.}
\textsuperscript{ix} Bute and Jensen, “Narrative Sensemaking,” 212-232.
\textsuperscript{xi} “Real Education,” \textit{GovTrack.us}.
\textsuperscript{xii} Douglas and Fenton, “Understanding Sexual Health,” 1-4.
Ibid.


Ibid.

Ibid.

Ibid.


Ibid.

Ibid.

Ibid.


Ibid.

Ibid.

Ibid.


Ibid.

Ibid.

Ibid.

Ibid.


Ibid.

Ibid.

Ibid.


Sufrin, Crein, Chang, “Contraception Services for Incarcerated Women,” 561-565.

Ibid.

Ibid.

Ibid.


Ibid.

Ibid.

Ibid.

Ibid.


Ibid.


Ibid, p. 373.


Ibid.


Ibid.


Ibid.

Ibid.


Ibid.

Ibid.

Ibid.

Ibid.

Ibid.

Ibid.


Ibid.

Ibid.


c Ibid.

Ibid.


Ibid.

Byrne, Goshin, and Joestl, “Intergenerational Transmission of Attachment,” 375-393.


Byrne, Goshin, and Joestl, “Intergenerational Transmission of Attachment,” 375-393.


Ibid.

Ibid.

Ibid, p. 34.

Ibid.

Ibid.

Ibid, p. 34.

Ibid.

Ibid, p. 36.

Ibid, p. 36.


MEANINGFUL LOOKING: THE POWER OF PROVOCATIVE IMAGES AS LANGUAGE, CURRICULUM, AND ENGAGEMENT
Catherine Kinyon, Oklahoma City Community College & University of Oklahoma

…Photography is not practiced by most people as an art. It is mainly a social rite, a defense against anxiety, and a tool of power.

—Susan Sontag, On Photography, 1977

Figure 1. Just Look at Them

Digital Imagery Is a Common Tongue

Mandarin Chinese is the most commonly spoken language worldwide¹; however, there is another language that has managed to slide into global prominence with such subtlety that many seem unaware of it or its significance: the language of images. Image as a language is not a new concept. Paintings (and other art forms) have long been used to communicate such things such as religious dogma, rules for living, and political messages. Those who created art (in the Western tradition) were able to live and even thrive as artists because of the support of wealthy/powerful patrons. The growth of personal images began to accelerate at the start of the development of the photographic medium. While artists still painted and relied on commissions of patrons, more images could be captured by a person with a tool (a camera), and the photographer may (or may not) consider herself or himself an artist. Eastman Kodak “Brownie” simplified the camera to the press of a button. Priced at one dollar, the “Brownie” sold a hundred thousand units in 1900.¹

¹ Mandarin Chinese is the first language for nearly one billion people.
http://www.nationsonline.org/oneworld/most_spoken_languages.htm
Fixing the monocular image to paper once required a person skilled in dark room work. For those who could afford the expense, professional printing labs facilitated the growing number of photographers wanting prints. Currently, professional printing labs employing skilled people have largely been replaced by machines monitored by minimally trained people, further reducing the cost and quality of printing. At present, many people take digital pictures, print sparingly, and keep numerous digital albums. Photography has become a series of digital images that need be never printed nor touched, only seen. While over a billion Facebook\textsuperscript{ii} users upload 350 million pictures every day, another 700 million appear and disappear within 10 seconds through Snapchat. \textsuperscript{iii} More than 250 billion images are on Facebook alone.\textsuperscript{iv} Digital image sharing is woven as intricately as words as a means of transmitting, touching, and connecting with others. Digital imagery is a common tongue.

People of nearly all ages, near and far, speak this visual language. Digital images are also the by-product of sightless aperture of tools which once learned can capture pieces of anything, of anyone. Much like the spoken vernacular, image sharing allows others to view the chronicles of another’s days and nights in a fluid stream of color and variety. Moreover, the camera itself has been “demystified,” made affordable, and has been integrated into phones. Over the last 40 years, the refinement of digital cameras, lenses, and options for image manipulation have expanded exponentially.

Figure 2. Meal Shared
Online documentation of meals shared, baby’s firsts, and the “artfully” transformed join to form a
digital sea of the good, bad, beautiful, the disgusting, and everything in between. At the core of
this unfettered barrage of digital imagery may be that everyone—and no one—is an artist. Images
can reveal truths, make lies truth or suggest truths and lies. Even knowing images can be false; we
tend to believe what we see—even more than what we read or hear.

**Educational Potential of a Digital Imagery**

Unlike verbal language, visual language is often neglected in the public school curriculum.
Without instruction on visual literacy, how will students develop their ability to select, use, create,
understand, or critique imagery in a meaningful way? There is an expectation that high school
graduates will have achieved standards in the areas of mathematics, science, history, and English.
Theoretically, in four years, this curriculum will provide graduates the education they will need to
make them good citizens and community members, as well as prepare them to work or meet the
academic challenges of college. And when it does not? What then? In practice, many graduates
enter college without the requisite skills to be successful. A student’s socio-economic status (SES)
plays a significant role in student success. Low-income students may dream of college, but a real
or perceived lack of preparation and actual college enrollment numbers reveal a different
educational picture. The big question for colleges is how to undo the academic achievement gap
between those with privilege, opportunity, and access and those without. Big questions seem to
require answers that change the social fabric of our society.

---

2 Oklahoma current curriculum requires one unit of Fine Arts or Speech. Fine Art is defined as Music, Art, or Drama.
The parents of over 50 thousand children have opted their children out of college-prep curriculum. This number is up
from 44 thousand in 2007. Data from the Oklahoma State Department of Education:

3 Oklahoma City Community College’s three big goals: Increase the number of our students who complete
a certificate or degree by 50%; Close the academic achievement gaps that persist with our low-income, first
The big question asked in Virginia Woolfs *Three Guineas* is, “How in your opinion are we to prevent war?” How does one challenge social class divisions or the prevalent culture of war? Woolf begins to address her question by directing the reader’s attention to photographs on a table.

Figure 3. *Piles of Bodies*  

Figure 4. *Tortured, Starved and Charred Bodies of Prisoners*

She might argue these photographs are visual truths rather than merely images recorded in light and shade. These photographs are not easy to look at: “they are photographs of dead bodies for the most part...of what might be a man’s body or a woman’s; [and] those certainly are dead children.” What do these images convey about those captured in that moment, those who captured that moment, and those who created the circumstances of that moment? For Woolf, these images speak of war, of horror, and of disgust.

In *On Photography*, Susan Sontag writes about the potency of photography as a medium. As photography became more accessible, the ability of the photographer to elicit emotion from
viewers declined. Sontag suggests with the possible exceptions of images of the most horrific sort, it is rare for images to retain the power to cry out, to reach beyond the flat dimension to hold rapt the viewer. Are there examples of images of power or lack thereof that demand engagement, even if only momentarily, that might be placed alongside of Woolf’s images on the imagined table? What might these images look like?

Consider a pernicious image that is meant to perpetuate ideas about race and class. An image meant to help retain current cultural constructs and is so enmeshed in the fabric of everyday life can become as comfortable as skin for some or loop like an endless negative message for others. Imagine the image of Disney’s Snow White added to Woolf’s table. Snow White’s name reveals her race and the tale follows cultural norms: she is destined (regardless of adversity) because of her race normed beauty and goodness to have a happily-ever-after hetero future.

Figure 5.

LOOKING INTO THE MIRROR, THE BLACK WOMAN ASKED, "MIRROR, MIRROR ON THE WALL, WHO'S THE FINEST OF THEM ALL?" THE MIRROR SAYS, "SNOW WHITE, YOU BLACK BITCH, AND DON'T YOU FORGET IT!!!"

Carrie Mae Weems, Mirror, Mirror, 1987
From the Ain’t Joking Series

4 Carrie Mae Weems, Mirror, Mirror, 1987 http://carriemaeweems.net/galleries/aint-jokin.html
Imagine now, the addition of another version of Snow White by Carrie Mae Weems called *Mirror/Mirror* (1987). While Disney’s *Snow White* will live happily ever after, Weems seems to be giving her “Snow White” a different destiny. Is Weems saying there will be no rescue for her or that she must rescue herself? As Weems’ black Snow White looks into the mirror, the mirror denies her fineness and says, "Snow White, You Black Bitch, and Don't You Forget It!!" Life experiences of the viewer draw the message from the image. Both Weems’ *Mirror/Mirror* and Woolf’s images of war grapple with those big questions. They have the power and potential to engage the viewer in conversation, challenge currently held beliefs and ideals, and even to promote change.

Weems’ *Mirror/Mirror* reflects the unvarnished truth of America’s class, gender, and race system within a literary/visual device meant to hide the truth in the mirror, specifically the distinction between those granted happily-ever-after and those who are not. Weems invites the viewer to look in on this beautiful woman even as she gazes into a mirror. The title of the work begins with a version of the familiar fairy tale litany of *mirror, mirror on the wall*… and ends with a clear declaration of oppression. The mirror’s response reveals the existence of a dominant culture to which the other is simply inferior. Woolf, too, writes of barriers between class and educated men, as well as barriers for the daughters of educated men. Educated men, she writes, crossed a bridge each day, ascending pulpits, practicing things that maintain life stations. Woolf describes their clothing image as “splendid” dress and military-like, ritual-driven attire. Surely, they were the most fair in the land. Daughters of educated men and others could expect little and struggled to make a living wage.
Artist-Teachers and Community Colleges

Woolf suggested an educational solution for the daughters of educated men and others who had been excluded. This model would begin to answer the big questions. Rather than recreating an old model that didn’t work, they should try a new model: the poor college\textsuperscript{x}. Today’s community colleges embody Woolf’s description of the poor college by providing open access to students. Community colleges have multiplied and grown in their influence on higher education and now educate nearly half of all students in the United States\textsuperscript{xi}. Woolf wrote, “[At poor colleges there] would be none of the barriers of wealth and ceremony, of advertisement and competition which now make the old and rich universities …cities of strife.”\textsuperscript{xii} The curriculum of the poor college, Woolf wrote, is medicine (nursing), mathematics, music, painting, and literature, all considered subjects that can be taught “cheaply.” Skills acquired through a general education are deemed vital to “live rightly and well in a free society.”\textsuperscript{xiii} How does general education help one to “live rightly and well” in an undeclared class system and what can educators do “when invaluable portions of [cultural] wealth [are] not passed down?”\textsuperscript{xiv} As in Woolf’s model, teaching is key. Woolf wrote that teachers at the poor college should be “good livers”\textsuperscript{xv} as well as “good thinkers.”\textsuperscript{xvi} Moreover, “musicians, painters, writers, would teach there, because they would learn.”\textsuperscript{xvii} The artist-teacher in a community college has one central responsibility, to teach.

Re-visionsing Art Appreciation for Answers to Big Questions

For community college students selecting art appreciation as a general education humanities elective, creating the context for meaningful art encounters\textsuperscript{xviii} has multiple challenges. All class sections require a textbook. After reviewing the scant books on the history of art education in America, one point is plain: the perspective is situated firmly in the Western tradition (Efland, Parsons and Blocker, Smith). This Western perspective is paralleled in the half dozen or more textbooks used to teach art appreciation (Gilbert/Getlein 88-; Sayre 94-, Fichner-Rathus 86-;
Prebles 72-; Russell 75-93; and Zelanski 87-). In addition, all of these texts contain the following commonalities: an initial look at what constitutes art, explanations of the elements and media of art, and a linear view of art history. While the textbooks have added some “global” content (art of women and people of color primarily), the texts have changed little in structure and content from their very first iteration. Publishers provide image banks for these books and function as de facto canon maker and keeper. Thus, the textbook has a distinct structure and encouraged pedagogy for instruction. More often than not, students will find a classroom with desks in a row, a room darkened for students to see projected images packaged with the textbook, and a banking model method (Freire, 2007) for delivering course content. The construction of course outcomes commonly show an assumption that students are only capable of demonstrating knowledge at the lowest levels of Bloom’s Taxonomy: remembering and understanding.

In The Pedagogy of the Oppressed, Paolo Freire (1970) defines contradiction as the “dialectical conflict between opposing social forces.” (p. 46) Freire uses the existing social structure as a starting point to construct dialogue through which a conversation can occur between those who control the means and ways of the modern world (the oppressor) and those who are made to preserve this world (the oppressed). These social poles while existing in opposition can also occur in concert within the oppressed. The oppressed, living in a world constructed and defined by those who dominate them, have internalized their subjugation. These internalized values further blind and delude the oppressed into affirming these confining boundaries as the only hope of improvement of their life circumstances. In short, by espousing oppressor’s values, the oppressed are able to better their lives within the oppressor-constructed world. The crux of the problem preventing liberation lies in perceptions. Current educational practices transfer knowledge through infusing information into the oppressed as students. This body of information is constructed to maintain the oppressor’s world view. A change in educational practices must occur in order to provide students the opportunity to develop a vision of their potential. When the oppressed are able to “see” oppression, the struggle (and the educational experience) is transformed into a quest for freedom. With the realization of the interwoven relationship of the oppressed and the oppressor, the oppressed enter unfamiliar terrain to begin the struggle “to regain their lost humanity.” (p.43) This waking perception of themselves and their condition of subordination is the point of reflection. Contradiction, in this context, is a manifestation of the struggle to be free. For the oppressed, “this can be done only by means of praxis: reflection and action upon the world order to transform it.” (p. 51)

Blooms Taxonomy of Educational objectives is a hierarchy of learning; Present course objectives follow the textbook content:

- Have a greater understanding of the roles that artists perform in making art [Blooms (B) Level 2].
- Look at art through new perspectives [B Level 1].
- Analyze art through critical thought [B Level 4].
- Become aware of the responsibilities of the viewer [B Level 1].
- Explore the relationships of artwork through culture and history on a global [B Level 2].
- Understand the elements and techniques that make a work of art happen [B Level 2].
- Discover mediums used to make two and three dimensional artwork [B Level 1].
- Identify famous art masterpieces and the artist that made them [B Level 2].
Finally, art appreciation in this form does not encourage what John Dewey terms “having an experience.” He wrote that art is "set apart from common experience, and serve[s] as insignia of taste and certificates of special culture." The textbook and instructor “know” about art. This places more distance between students and the subject matter. The perpetuation of an unreal aesthetic hierarchy creates a class system for art. Decoding this hierarchy requires understanding the criteria and context of objects (Parsons and Blocker). These elements (and others) are foundational pillars in the preservation of a sexist, intellectualist, and elitist*7 Western art narrative and, consequently, the continued cultural miseducation of art appreciation and the student. The dissection of course content and correlating traditional pedagogies begs the question, what is the value of an art appreciation curriculum for community college students? Is the curriculum an instrument of social class control? Concerns for making students aware of the significance of the canon, in effect overshadows the immediacy of art in their lives and serves to further distance them from art. Traditionally, students’ knowledge is considered limited; however, students enter the classroom with a wide range of experience. Students are frequently accustomed to relying on others (friends, internet, and parents) for their “claims to know.” How the instructor positions himself or herself as keeper of the course content or co-investigator determines whether students learn to trust their knowledge claims from real world experience, their “awakening consciousness,” and their “subjective certainties.”

Meaningful Looking: The Power of Provocative Images as Language, Curriculum, and Engagement

Maintaining the current pedagogical model is unlikely to bridge any rifts and promises only more of the same. In order to end the homogeneity of the past 40 some years, we must employ

---

7 The Isms of miseducation: The practice of disinterest or what Dewey calls “the submission to convention in practice and intellectual procedure,” (Dewey, 40)
Woolf’s metaphoric “Rags. Petrol. [and] Matches.” We can burn the old to make space for a new curriculum and pedagogy to be re-visioned. Inside this new curriculum, using Woolf’s images of war alongside other images which engage, provoke, entice, and disrupt the gendered, raced, ethnocentric, and classed cannon in order to shake the viewer (Like Weems’s Work), students could develop their ability to select, use, create, understand, and critique imagery in a meaningful way. How might these students engage these “horrifying” and even “disgusting” images as curriculum and further challenge and change cultural constructs? How could an art appreciation curriculum centered in classroom encounters of disgust provide a new means of “appreciating” art as a visual language which encourages analysis, and, in turn, challenges the cultural miseducation of community college students?
Endnotes


vi Ibid, 10-11.


viii Woolf, 69.

ix Ibid, 19.

x Ibid, 34.


xii Ibid, 34.


xv Ibid

xvi Ibid


xix Ibid, 9.


xxii Code, 250.

xxiii Woolf, 36.

Images

Figure 2. Catherine Kinyon. 2014. “Shared Meal” Digital image.


POWER IN FEMINIST PEDAGOGIES:  
THE CASE OF SEX EDUCATION IN FRANCE

Vanina Mozziconacci, Ecole Normale Supérieure de Lyon, France

Before presenting my work about feminist pedagogies and power, I would like to step back a little and explain the methodological and heuristical approach this lecture is supposed to illustrate. In this paper, education can be seen as a laboratory for feminist theories: a locus where concepts can be put to the test. By going back and forth between theories and practice, education helps us evaluate the different paradigms in feminist thought. In this lecture, I will try to do this with the notion of "power" and the way it is conceptualized in two different feminist pedagogical theories.

On the one hand, there are feminist pedagogies inspired by critical pedagogy. Critical pedagogy, as defined in Paulo Freire's *Pedagogy of the Oppressed* (1968) consists in changing the pedagogical relationship itself (and not only the content of courses) in order to empower students. Paulo Freire criticizes the "vertical " relationship of traditional pedagogies and the "banking model" of teaching that underlies it, which considers students as passive receivers. Changing the form of teaching is thus a requisite to end oppression, because an education that encourages students to be passive socializes them to subservience (Bingham, 2008). The aim of critical pedagogy is "conscientization", that is to say the understanding of the social and political dimensions of one's biography. Once the critical consciousness is reached, the oppressed no longer allow the oppressive consciousness to invade their mind and become truly autonomous (Freire, 1996).

On the other hand, there are feminist thinkers who belong to poststructuralism, in which key concepts such as discourse, power, knowledge and truth – which are indeed central to education – are no longer defined as they are in humanism (Adams St. Pierre, 2000). In a
nutshell, poststructuralism focuses on the way meanings are acquired and change, and on their links with power; it considers that every discourse is a structure of categories and beliefs specific to a time and place. This has consequences for both the notion of power and the notion of truth: they must be analyzed together, because truth induces effects of power.

I will take the example of sex education sessions in France¹. I use a paper co-authored with sociologist Aurore Le Mat (Le Mat and Mozziconacci, 2013), who conducted fieldwork in classrooms in 2012² and I analyze official texts from the ministry that establish programs. Even if the influence of critical pedagogy in French sex education is not explicit most of the time, I will show how the methods used are similar to its principles. Besides, research has shown that conscientization theories have been recently rediscovered and used in the medico-social field in France (Mathieu, 2002).

In principle, students between 12 and 18 in France must have at least three sex education sessions per year, with no obligation in terms of duration. Volunteers among the school staff (teachers, nurses, advisors...) or people from external organizations authorized by the ministry can provide these lessons. The leitmotiv of official sex education guides is to "free speech" during these (rather short and punctual) sessions. Compared to traditional classes, there is indeed a shift in expectations, but the institutional context stays the same. Students are still in the same school, in their usual classrooms, and sometimes even with the same educators. But, for a short amount of time, rather than listening and taking notes, they are enjoined to speak up and express themselves. The shift can be explicitly signaled by discussion leaders when they introduce themselves, as noted in Aurore Le Mat's study, by saying sentences like "today I am not Mrs X., I am Monique" or "today I am not here as your math teacher, but as Veronique, and we are going

¹ Studies comparing French sex education with other countries' multiply. See Elisa Jasmin's article and Elise Devieilhe's PhD dissertation in the list of references.
² Two observations in classrooms made for a PhD dissertation in secondary schools near Lille (North of France).
to talk about sexuality”. From this point on and for the next hour, the students are supposed to talk, give their opinions and share their feelings. This is clearly stated in the official texts:

"Sex education sessions must not take the form of a discourse or a course on sexuality. It is more about giving time and space for conversation, debates, enabling the students to ignite their own thinking, to express themselves about every topic that might concern them. Discussion leaders, however, should not limit their role to listening, but also should be able to identify students’ questions, to provide clear and precise information, and to guide the group’s reflection.”

(Ministère de l'Education Nationale. 2014a)3

Sex education is supposed to address health concerns but also gender equality concerns, with issues such as homophobia or sexual violence. In short, this is the practical and theoretical background of these sessions. I am not stating that these are the exact reflection of critical pedagogy principles but commonalities deserve to be noted:

- they tend to consider that the classroom can become a homogeneous space where vertical relations are abolished (no teachers or students, only people). In the same way, critical pedagogies identify the class as a "we", standing together in fighting domination.

- Both projects are teleological. Sex education in France is called "éducation à la sexualité", which means that this education aims towards something (" à " is the same as " to "). Even if the discussion is supposed to be a spontaneous exchange, some information and principles must be transmitted in the end. In critical pedagogy, there is also a goal, which is "authentic consciousness ".

- Both rely on the idea that pedagogy can "empower " students. Education is not only supposed to deliver knowledge but also to deliver power. This is stated by the ministry

3 My translation from the French original.
itself: "sex education aims at (...) developing attitudes such as self-esteem, respect, solidarity, autonomy and responsibility" (Ministère de l'Education Nationale. 2014b)\(^4\).

Empowerment is closely linked to the idea of "freedom of speech", with the assumption that emancipation means taking the floor, whereas silence signifies mental blocks and domination.

Enough with the principles and ideas. What happens during these classes? Let me summarize my colleague's findings for you, focusing on the students' reactions to these sessions.

I will also connect these reactions with some of the criticism that poststructuralist feminists have leveled at critical pedagogy (Luke and Gore, 1992):

- The students seem to be really confused by the shift in classroom expectations. They ask their "former" teacher: "Can we call you Monique?" but they still call her "Ma'am" and continue to talk to her as if she was still their teacher.

  This strongly relates to what poststructuralist feminists call "decontextualization" in critical pedagogies. These pedagogies are assumed to be inherently liberating discourses by their supporters regardless of the location of the practices. But, as Jennifer Gore states, "context must be conceived as filled with social actors whose personal and group histories position them as subjects immersed in social patterns" (Gore, 1992, 61). The fact that Monique is a white middle-class woman in her forties who lives in a different neighborhood and that most of the students are racialized and/or working-class teenagers between 13 and 15, must be taken into account. The fact that these sessions take place in an educational institution is not anodyne either: Monique might be "Monique" today, but she will be the math teacher again tomorrow, and she still plays a very precise role in the school hierarchy.

- The students are supposed to "free their speech" but a lot of them remain silent. The girls

\(^4\) My translation from the French original.
in particular clearly express with their corporeal positions that they do not want to talk
(arms crossed, looking elsewhere...).

Questioning the calls for "student voices" is the subject of Mimi Orner's famous text "Interrupting the Calls for Student Voice in 'Liberatory' Education: A Feminist Poststructuralist Perspective" (Orner, 1992). The idea of an "authentic voice" that must be freed in the classroom goes implies the assumption that there is a true and unified subject "underneath" the speech. It "presumes students, voices and identities to be singular, unchanging and unaffected by the context in which the speaking occurs" (Orner, 1992, 80). Yet, Orner underlines that critical pedagogues themselves admit that silence can be a form of defense and a form of resistance, "the refusal to talk prevents others from knowing what students think or feel and using it against them" (Orner, 1992, 88).

Some students express how disillusioned they are with the discussion leader's guidance, and feel that her advice is not realistic and does not fit their experiences. For example, they tell the discussion leader that she completely underestimates the importance of reputation in this neighborhood and the fact that girls who go out with boys publicly take risks. Instead of starting from students' actual living conditions, discussion leaders aim at a supposedly neutral ideal divorced from students' daily lives.

This is all the more surprising given that critical pedagogy requires starting from students' living conditions (Freire, 1968 and 1996). This may mean that French sex education does not fully apply critical pedagogy's principles. But more fundamentally, I think this contradiction reveals a real tension within critical pedagogy, between its teleological form and its demand to start from students' experiences. Critical pedagogy aims at an authentic consciousness that the teacher is supposed to already possess or at least to be able to identify. But, as Jennifer Gore
states, "when the agent of empowerment assumes to be already empowered, arrogance can underlie claims of ‘what we can do for you’ (...) we need to acknowledge that our agency has limits, that we might ‘get it wrong’ in assuming we know what would be empowering for others" (Gore, 1992, 61-63). As Elizabeth Ellsworth writes, the teacher "does not play the role of disinterested mediator on the side of the oppressed group (...) there are things that I as a professor could never know about the experiences, oppressions and understandings of other participants in the class. This situation makes it impossible for any single voice in the classroom – including that of the professor – to assume the position of center or origin of knowledge or authority, of having privileged access to authentic experience or appropriate language" (Ellsworth, 1992, 101).

The most important aspect here, with which I want to conclude, is the idea that students are supposed to be "empowered" by the discussion leader during those sessions. This goes with a reifying notion of power as something that can be possessed and transmitted, rather than as polymorphous networks and mechanisms. This conception is highly problematic and explains much about the issues raised before. As Jennifer Gore argues "these claims to empowerment attribute extraordinary abilities to the teacher, and hold a view of agency which risks ignoring the context(s) of teachers’ work" (Gore, 1992, 57). This is exactly what happens in the case of French sex education when teachers deny the importance of their position in the institutional and social world. A context-specific analysis, with power described as relations revealed in specific practices, would direct our attention to the microdynamics of its operations at the level of the classroom. For example, teachers should admit that there is no such thing as "free speech", understood as a speech without constraints, especially in the classroom: students' voices (and silence) should rather be interpreted as effects of the regulation of the self through others (which
would explain for example why silence is gendered during these sessions).

As poststructuralism mainly defines itself by questioning structuralist and humanist concepts, feminist pedagogic thought inspired by this movement is a critical point of view on education rather than a systematic prescriptive theory. It does not intend to destroy all that has been built by conscientization pedagogies, but to give tools to amend them and elaborate an accurate feminist pedagogy. From what I've discussed in this presentation, this could take the form of the following reforms:

- to abandon any teleological method in order to pay more attention to local and specific contexts and conditions,

or

- to consider that the goal of education remains the transmission of knowledge rather than the transmission of power, which would conserve that education is a mediation between students and knowledge, and not an apparatus of control that seeks to act directly upon students by exhorting them to be one way or the other.
List of references


Acknowledgements

Grants from the Association Française des Femmes Diplômées des Universités (AFFDU) / Dorothy Leet and the Programme Avenir Lyon Saint-Etienne (PALSE) supported this research. Many thanks to my friend Ekédi Mpondo-Dika, for her valuable suggestions.
Context/Purpose: Despite a growing need for a diverse workforce, women’s participation in science and engineering occupations continues to lag and women continue to be underrepresented in science, technology, engineering, and mathematics (STEM) disciplines in institutions of higher education across the nation (NSF, 2013). The job satisfaction of academic women in STEM disciplines is lower than men’s, and women tend to leave their academic careers earlier than their male counterparts (Hill, Corbett & Rose, 2010). Many reasons account for women’s underrepresentation, including “pipeline” and climate issues, bias, and work-life conflict (Handelsman et al, 2005; NAS, 2006; Philipsen & Bostic, 2010; Ward & Wolf-Wendel, 2012).

In response, many institutions of higher education have made attempts to remedy the situation, sometimes aided by such funding agencies as the National Science Foundation whose ADVANCE grants have, since 2001, specifically targeted the recruitment and retention of women in STEM disciplines (NSF, 2014). Other institutional efforts include diversity planning, institutionalizing “inclusive excellence” offices, improving recruitment efforts, family-friendly policies and programs, and so forth. Yet and still, institutional transformation remains difficult to achieve, and change is slow.

The purpose of the proposed paper is to better understand obstacles to institutional transformation by applying Robert Keagan and Lisa Lahey’s Immunity to Change (2009) approach to change efforts at Metropolitan University (MU, a pseudonym), a major research university in the metropolitan Southeast.
Methods: This paper is based upon analysis of the following data sources:

- institutional data on representation of faculty in STEM disciplines by gender
- document analysis of institutional reports/plans/policies
- institutional climate and COACHE surveys

Arguments: In the last four years, MU has implemented strategic initiatives to enhance faculty excellence and an inclusive university environment. Despite declining state support since 2008, an excellence hiring initiative has added over 200 faculty positions, including prominent research focused positions, and endowed chairs and professorships. A particular focus has been to recruit and retain talented and diverse STEM faculty. MU’s new Office of Faculty Recruitment and Retention promotes the hiring and retention of outstanding and diverse faculty members; the development, implementation and interpretation of faculty policies; and the development and coordination of academic leadership development programs.

In 2010, MU approved a Diversity Plan with six major goals dealing with climate, faculty, staff, and student diversity, and diversity in university/community partnerships. The plan evolved from a 2007 campus climate survey that revealed women and minorities are particularly dissatisfied with campus climate, citing inequities in workload, salary, and promotional opportunities. The Diversity Plan calls for greater attention to providing leadership opportunities for underrepresented groups, expanding a dual-career program for spousal or partner hires, enhancing mentorships, and providing work flexibility to improve work/life balance for faculty. In September 2012, the University appointed a Vice President for Inclusive Excellence, to work with administrative leaders to implement well-coordinated actions that focus on fostering greater diversity, equity, inclusion and accountability at every level of university life. These efforts are
critically important for STEM faculty given that only 5% (20) are from underrepresented populations (African American, Native American or Hispanic/Latino), only two of whom are full professors. While such efforts are underway, the STEM disciplines at MU continue to battle underrepresentation of female faculty, as figure 1 illustrates.

**Figure 1:** Teaching and Research (T&R) Faculty in STEM (Fall 2013) at MU.

In the School of Engineering, women account for 15% of tenured_tenure-eligible (T/TE) faculty members (8 of 55 total). Representation for STEM disciplines in the College of Humanities and Sciences and School of Medicine is better, where women comprise 33% of T/TE faculty (30 of 92 total) and 34% of T/TE faculty (39 of 115 total), respectively. Figure 1 illustrates the percentage of STEM women faculty at various ranks at MU. The percentages of STEM women faculty in tenure and tenure-eligible positions are comparable to national averages.
However, the percentage of MU STEM women faculty in non-tenure-eligible positions is high compared with the national norm (MU 14.5%; U.S. 5%).

**Arguments:** As illustrated above, despite ongoing efforts, women continue to be starkly underrepresented in STEM disciplines at MU. Change in academe can be painfully slow. The formal literature on higher education change—as well as the anecdotal grapevine—is littered with examples of institutional initiatives stalled by various forms of resistance (Kezar & Lester, 2011). More often than not the source of the stall is the academic department (Wergin, 2003), specifically the department chair, who in the role of gatekeeper sees part of his or her job as making sure that administrative mandates do not unduly disrupt the work of the faculty. The result can be that chairs of STEM departments support career-enhancement activities as long as they advance the bottom line of increased extramural funding for the department. Often these activities do not result in fundamental change, and the departmental climate for women in STEM disciplines remains the same. The resistance to change phenomenon is not limited to department chairs, academic departments, or higher education at-large. Organizational change has been the subject of thousands of books and articles in the past 75 years, beginning with the seminal work of Kurt Lewin (1951), followed by such theorists as Chris Argyris (1985), Warren Bennis (1985), Peter Senge (1990), and Ronald Heifetz (1994). To some degree each has subscribed to a central tenet put forth by Lewin: in order to actuate change, an agent of change must first identify the key barriers that are holding back progress, then systematically remove or weaken those barriers. This simple truism held sway until the publication of *Immunity to Change*, by Robert Kegan and Lisa Lahey (2009). The authors, developmental psychologists, drew upon their research with both individuals and organizations to suggest that facilitating organizational change is a matter of
recognizing that even individuals and groups with a real commitment to change face barriers that are difficult to dislodge, that these barriers exist for valid reasons and thus have built-in “immunities.”

**Significance:** Applying the immunity-to-change concept to MU, it becomes obvious that despite long-term efforts geared at diversifying MU’s faculty, we continue to under-recruit STEM women faculty, possibly because of an unconscious commitment to “gender-free” hiring. Despite the university’s philosophical commitment to the importance of spousal-partner hiring, some units have established a culture supportive of spousal-partner hiring while others view spousal-partner hiring as “dumping a faculty member into a department.” Paid family-leave and tenure-clock extension are either not offered or at times reluctantly used for fear of stigmatization. Awareness of immunity-to-change is significant because it informs not just the reform efforts at MU but those at institutions of higher education more generally.
References

A CONVERSATION ABOUT SHAME FOR GENDER-SENSITIVE EDUCATION
WHAT CAN WE LEARN FROM THE NOBLE HIGH DRESS CODE CONTROVERSY?

Sula You
University of Oklahoma

Why are girls more likely to feel ashamed in school? What makes girls vulnerable to shame? Although shame, which is an uncomfortable feeling that anybody can have, is conceptually gender-neutral, the tone of the term shame seems to be gender-biased. A bigger problem is that, as Bartky states, women indeed are more shame-prone than men in sexist societies where people put much value on maleness and masculinity.¹ To handle this problem, a precise understanding of shame and an acquaintance with gender-sensitive pedagogy are needed.

Gender sensitivity refers to the ability to recognize gender issues. It requires people to be aware of established gender roles and gender stereotypes.² Gender-sensitive education is a pedagogical approach that focuses on improving gender sensitivity. It attempts to achieve gender equity within education by giving equal treatment to both girls and boys. It encourages “a critical and constant review of the meaning and evaluation attached to gender.”³ Empowering girls is a crucial part of gender-sensitive education’s strategy, however, the reality is just the opposite. Differential, even more discouraging treatment of students based on sex still exists in educational settings. In this sense, this paper tries to answer such questions as: What barriers are there to gender sensitivity in education? Why does moral education need to take up the gender-sensitive perspective, especially concerning the consequences and values of shame?

Shame is feeling inferior, so the shame experience involves “distress concerning a state of the self.” The person experiencing shame has a low opinion of oneself, “as no good or as not good enough.”⁴ In other words, shame rests on a negative self-concept. But then again, this aspect, paradoxically, just becomes decisive evidence of shame’s moral quality from some
philosophical perspectives. For example, according to Taylor, shame is primarily tied to self-respect, which involves in one’s value. Experiencing shame, accompanying an unfavorable attitude towards oneself, corresponds to the loss of self-respect.\(^5\) In this sense, theoretically, shame deserves attention because of its moral attribute, which arises from self-evaluation by one’s own autonomous judgment about what is respectable.

But such an explanation, as Calhoun reveals, can be problematic in terms of following the same old ways of rationalist philosophical logic. The mainstream Western intellectualist philosophy has rationalized the belittlement of shame-prone people by reason that they are less reasonable, autonomous, and mature. For Taylor, feeling ashamed of being a target of sexual harassment or racist jokes would not be appropriate. Suggesting the superiority of genuine shame, which is always morally deserved and constructive, Taylor claims that a mature person need not feel shame about the kind of shaming that cannot be morally justified. Based on this intellectualist perspective, if someone suffers from false shame, which is said to involve a cognitive error, that person may not have an appropriate moral schema about what is truly shameful.\(^6\) This argument surprisingly resembles the logic of victim blaming.

It is notable that having a sufficiently critical moral perspective cannot completely preclude you from feeling shame. In addition, for most people, being conscious about how I am perceived by others is also important as well as natural. Roberts points out:

Shame is based on a concern to be “respectable,” encompassing both intrinsic personal worthiness in physical appearance, athletic skill, intellectual aptitude, artistic sensitivity, moral rectitude, etc., and the social appearance of such worthiness.\(^7\) This aspect of shame should be thoroughly considered, in particular, in educational settings. Even a person, who is deeply concerned for intrinsic respectability, can be ashamed by the
shaming gaze of others when his/her social respectability is frustrated. Namely, perceiving self as the object of others’ criticism can trigger shame-feelings.\textsuperscript{8} It follows that anyone who is undervalued by society is vulnerable to shame. This reminds the issue of gender because one side of both sexes has historically been underrepresented or undervalued across many cultures.

We should be aware of inextricable connections between shame and social norms around sex and gender. If a society tries to construct a gender norm or regulate a sexual morality, the members of society may be encouraged to feel ashamed or to participate in shaming practices. This implies that social pressure seriously affects the ideas of shame or shaming. In society there is a double standard, particularly in regard to sexual morality, women tend to be judged harshly according to a set of much stricter criteria.\textsuperscript{9} When androcentric institutions intend girls to be prudish and passive, the second sex or inferior gender would be subjected to shameful treatments and further forced to internalize that shaming.

Here is a story that serves to illustrate this point. On the very first day of school at Noble High School in Noble, Oklahoma, a group of girls was left crying because a superintendent Ronda Bass humiliated them for the school dress code violations. According to a student, the superintendent said, “Have y’all ever seen any ‘skanks’ around this school? ... I don't want to see anyone's ass hanging out of their shorts.” In addition, by another student’s account, the next day while she did a dress code check in classroom, Bass singled out only girls and even asked some to bend over because, in her words, “If you're not comfortable with bending over, we might have a problem.” It is just obvious how the girls might feel. The teenage girls were treated unfairly, not to mention that they were shamed. After this incident, some parents have started a petition demanding the superintendent’s resignation. As a result, Noble school board decided to terminate her employment contract with the district.\textsuperscript{10}
Unfortunately, this is not an unprecedented event; rather, such discriminatory practices and disrespectful attitudes towards students have been around for years. The Noble superintendent’s talk and behavior were immoral and further miseducational. Also, it is clear that insulting remarks and inappropriate behaviors by Bass resulted in emotional harm or suffering to girls. Bass, in fact, humiliated the girls on purpose; hence this can be seen as sexual harassment. What is worse, her sorting according to gender, checking only girls’ outfits, is blameworthy in that it might encourage more students to unconsciously adopt a double standard.

Some may say that, for educative results, shaming is needed from time to time. A person, who emphasizes sexual morality in adolescence, may advocate a strict dress code and allow using shaming criticisms for rule breakers. However, as occasion demands, no matter how effective public shaming is, any norms and stereotypical beliefs that underlie the shaming punishment should be exhaustively examined. Even if the majority of people justify or permit the use of shaming as an educational strategy, its implementation should be realized impartially and timely.

On the sexual morality-dress code relationship, for some it is understandable how teenagers’ skimpy or unkempt clothing demonstrates today’s sexual morality degeneration. Even if it were so, by the reason of dress code violation, putting only girls to shame before boys is not sensible. The issue of female physical characteristics must have been considered. Because bodily development and changes that occur during puberty in girls are much faster and more visible, there tends to be a more rigid regulation controlling girls’ clothing.

Enforcing stricter regulations about girls’ attire is inappropriate from an educational viewpoint because it reflects gender-biased ideas. Also, it shows the school’s different moral structures by gender, i.e., an application of the double standard to dress code. Accordingly, this
practice may have negative consequences in connection with reinforcement of misguided ideas, such as ‘Girls should dress more conservatively than boys do,’ ‘A girl has to maintain her virginity,’ ‘It is fine for guys to have a lax attitude to sexual morality,’ or ‘It is more permissible for boys to break school regulations.’

Moreover, targeted shaming is detrimental to all students of both sexes. In case of Noble High, the superintendent shamed the girls as a target group to keep students in line. I would say there are several reasons why the superintendent’s conduct of public shaming and its underlying ideas are worrisome. First of all, the superintendent lacks understanding of shame/shaming matters. Second, the superintendent should focus more on sex education if the school dress code enhancement policy resulted from her concern about sexual morality development or sexual harassment prevention. Lastly, even for educational purposes, shaming must be carefully done in a respectful way in order to enable the shamed to reach self-reflection. Preserving a respectful attitude towards students and applying a sensible educational technique are needed.

It is important to know the difference between shame and shaming when you attempt to use shaming criticism or punishment for educational purposes. While a sense of shame is caused by the consciousness of one’s shortcoming, shaming could be defined as a behavior that brings shame to others. To produce shaming, there must be a shamer (either an individual or a group) and other-directed criteria, which passivize the shamed. Externally imposed shaming cannot create an autonomous sense of shame, but can cause the shamed to feel ashamed, more accurately to be humiliated. That is to say, shaming causes being ashamed but does not lead to feel the self-initiated shame in the strict sense. Shame-feelings involve one’s own evaluation of the situation; in other words, it reflects what he or she values or devalues.12
In reality, even in a shame-phobic society like the United States, where shame is regarded as taboo, shame-provoking situations still occur. Deliberately or not, we sometimes shame someone although we know shaming is never a desirable practice in principle. We have often seen children standing in front of their schools or on street corners holding signs apologizing for bad behavior. It is true that we use shaming criticisms like “Shame on you” or “I’m disappointed in you” to impress our expectations on the shamed.\(^\text{13}\) This shows us there are divergent dimensions around shaming; not every kind of shaming is caused by malice or the lack of consideration for others.

For students to enhance a proper sense of sexual morality, an affordable gender-sensitive sex education would be more practical than sexual repression or strict discipline in terms of the long-term perspective. In addition, sexual curiosity or caring about outward appearance is nothing to be ashamed of; rather, it is quite natural during the teen years. The real issue is how to create a sound, wholesome classroom environment that is free of all forms of sexual harassment.

The fact is that modern schooling has followed or reproduced the established sex/gender role system.\(^\text{14}\) Schooling has helped to perpetuate dichotomous conceptions of gender roles and stereotypes around sexuality. Adults carry the values and attitudes of their society into the classroom. Indeed, the superintendent directly expressed her sexist attitude, which might have been supported by other community members.

Giving the reason that girls’ inappropriate outfits distract learning atmosphere of school or make boys have a sexual urge, the superintendent may make her excuse by only shaming girls who violated the school dress code. But, on any account, it is undoubtedly true that she herself was the perpetrator of sexual harassment; Her sexist remarks and punishment caused sexual humiliation among the girls. Furthermore, the offensive experience of being sexually ashamed
does little to contribute to promoting or keeping strict sexual morality. Rather, shaming may have an adverse effect on building a healthy self-image because the shamed become more severe on themselves in order to avoid being ashamed again. Sexual shaming is unacceptable by both moral and educational standards.

From such circumstances, it follows that we need a radical, far-reaching educational approach that fits adequately to address the issues of sex and gender. Considering there is still a permissive attitude with boys and a pressure on boys, both culturally and from their peers, to engage in sexual practices in order to prove their manhood. Concentrating on gender sensitivity as an integral component of pedagogical practices is urgently called. This educational project is not limited to a certain course or program. I propose that this should extend beyond sex education from a more integrated framework: we need a gender-sensitive moral education that permeates the entire curriculum and that is infused into every individual subject matter.

Insights from a gender-sensitive perspective reveal underrepresented moral problems in educational practices, theoretically, methodologically, or systemically. Since moral issues are found in every aspect of life, and the topic of gender is pervasive in current literature, gender needs to be taken seriously in moral educational discourse. This is because moral education aims to help students become equipped with moral norms, values and etiquette that the society set for them.

Especially, as to the matters of sexual morality and tacit shaming criticism/punishment, it is necessary to examine the power dynamics in schooling as well as curriculum and textbook contents. To promote gender sensitivity in classroom, we are required to check the following, although this is not an exhaustive list: Does the curriculum vision suggest a gender sensitive approach? Is there any bias reflected towards a gender in any of the textual contents? Are there
any guidelines to the content developers with regard to gender sensitivity? Does the teacher avoid the use of clichés- like ‘boys don’t cry’ or ‘a tomboy’ consciously? Are both genders given equal status and role in performances in schools?\textsuperscript{15}

Again, shame is a tricky question. Basically, since morality is a gender-neutral concept, a philosophical attempt to reclaim a moral dimension of shame, seems appropriate. However, discussion on either shame or shaming without the issues of gender is virtually impossible. Shame is dangerous when it connotes humiliation and shaming is counterproductive when it shades into stigmatization.\textsuperscript{16} In fact, in society there are inegalitarian gender rules, women’s shame-proneness is intensified through the process of external shaming as it transforms into internal humiliation.

When we see shame as a solely private emotion, a female student’s experience of shame in its negative meaning would be seen as her personal issue. But, as gender has been socially constructed, we must know that a sense of shame linked to gender, properly or not, can be developed by an implicit cultural atmosphere and explicit schooling. Hence, correcting gender bias and discrimination requires an effort to untangle gender related issues around shame. This is why we need a gender-sensitive pedagogy.

A deep conversation about shame is positively necessary for gender-sensitive education. It requires us to carefully review the stream of thoughts, which either underscore the ethical significance of shame as self-critical assessment or allows shaming techniques as self-reflective discipline. Without rigorous consideration of gender, such ideas could work as a theoretical background of oppression towards women.

\textsuperscript{1} Sandra Lee Bartky, Shame and Gender in \textit{Femininity and Domination: Studies in the Phenomenology of Oppression} (New York: Routledge, 1990), 85.


8 Roberts, *Emotions*, 228.

9 For example, the novel *The Scarlet Letter* depicts this situation well.


11 Personally I do not think clothing has to do with sexual moral standards. The issue of what to wear cannot be applied to moral categories. In a general sense, women’s outfits do not have both moral and immoral values.


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Affiliation</th>
<th>Email</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jeannette Alarcon</td>
<td>University of North Carolina, Greensboro</td>
<td><a href="mailto:jeannette.alarcon@utexas.edu">jeannette.alarcon@utexas.edu</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jan Armstrong</td>
<td>University of New Mexico</td>
<td><a href="mailto:jka@unm.edu">jka@unm.edu</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stacia Ann Cedillo</td>
<td>The University of Texas, Austin</td>
<td><a href="mailto:stacia.cedillo@gmail.com">stacia.cedillo@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joshua Davis</td>
<td>University of Oklahoma</td>
<td><a href="mailto:joshdavis@ou.edu">joshdavis@ou.edu</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Julie Davis</td>
<td>University of Oklahoma</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Julie@ou.edu">Julie@ou.edu</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Susan Franzosa</td>
<td>Fairfield University</td>
<td><a href="mailto:sfranzosa@fairfield.edu">sfranzosa@fairfield.edu</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Julie Marie Frye</td>
<td>Indiana University Bloomington</td>
<td><a href="mailto:jmfrye@indiana.edu">jmfrye@indiana.edu</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mary Jo Hinsdale</td>
<td>Westminster College</td>
<td><a href="mailto:mjhinsdale@westminstercollege.edu">mjhinsdale@westminstercollege.edu</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kayley Mary Gillespie</td>
<td>University of Oklahoma</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Kayley.M.Gillespie-1@ou.edu">Kayley.M.Gillespie-1@ou.edu</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shahnaz Khan</td>
<td>Wilfrid Laurier University</td>
<td><a href="mailto:skhan@wlu.ca">skhan@wlu.ca</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Catherine Kinyon</td>
<td>University of Oklahoma</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ckipnyon@occc.edu">ckipnyon@occc.edu</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Susan Laird</td>
<td>University of Oklahoma</td>
<td><a href="mailto:laird@ou.edu">laird@ou.edu</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kelly McFaden</td>
<td>University of North Georgia</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Kelly.McFaden@ung.edu">Kelly.McFaden@ung.edu</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vanina Mozziconacci</td>
<td>Ecole Normale Superieure de Lyon, France</td>
<td><a href="mailto:vanina.mozziconacci@ens-lyon.fr">vanina.mozziconacci@ens-lyon.fr</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maike Philipsen</td>
<td>Virginia Commonwealth University</td>
<td><a href="mailto:miphilip@vcu.edu">miphilip@vcu.edu</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paula Salvio</td>
<td>University of New Hampshire</td>
<td><a href="mailto:pmsalivio@gmail.com">pmsalivio@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amy Shuffleton</td>
<td>Loyola University, Chicago</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ashuffle@luc.edu">ashuffle@luc.edu</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amy Smith</td>
<td>University of Oklahoma</td>
<td><a href="mailto:asmith@soonerclinical.com">asmith@soonerclinical.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Claudia Cervantes-Soon</td>
<td>University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ccsoom@email.unc.edu">ccsoom@email.unc.edu</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sula You</td>
<td>University of Oklahoma</td>
<td><a href="mailto:sula@ou.edu">sula@ou.edu</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kathryn Fishman-Weaver</td>
<td>University of Missouri-Columbia</td>
<td><a href="mailto:kathrynfweaver@gmail.com">kathrynfweaver@gmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
FLOOR PLAN
Mezzanine Level